Advancing Equity in the Illinois Workforce System

A Report From the Illinois Workforce Innovation Board Equity Task Force

Final Draft for Task Force Approval: May 18, 2022

Contents

Executive Summary

When it comes to educating, training, hiring, and advancing the Illinois workforce, some populations fare better than others. Women, people of color, people living with disabilities, rural area residents, justice-involved individuals, and other historically marginalized population groups do not have equitable access to economic prosperity. Addressing this lack of equity in the Illinois economy is critical, and the Illinois workforce system has a key role to play in that work.

The Illinois Workforce Innovation Board (IWIB) created the Equity Task Force (ETF) in October 2020 to address equity within the Illinois workforce system and ensure that all customers are on pathways to success. The 42-member ETF met bimonthly from October 2020 through May 2022. Three workgroups were established to carry out the work: Data, Policy, and Program. Each group met monthly beginning in November 2020. Through workgroup and task force meetings, background readings, and consultations with experts and practitioners, the ETF explored challenges and opportunities and developed recommendations. In addition to its recommendations to the IWIB, the ETF also identified opportunities for local workforce boards, recognizing the critical role local workforce system leaders and practitioners play in advancing equity.

The following key insights emerged from the work:

Challenges:

1. The Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA, P.L. 113-128) programs appear to be reaching the at-risk populations the workforce system is intended to serve. Some customers, however, have greater barriers than others, and it is not clear that all customers get the services they need to succeed.

2. There are differences in employment and earnings outcomes by race in the WIOA Adult, Dislocated Worker, and Youth programs, but it is difficult to isolate the impact of the WIOA programs from other socioeconomic factors that impact employment and earnings using WIOA data alone.

3. Services accessed and occupational focus of training varies by participants' sex and race.

4. The current infrastructure, staffing, and systems for collecting and analyzing WIOA data in Illinois are not designed to support robust analysis of disaggregated data necessary to advance equity.

5. Organizations providing culturally specific services with a track record of success in serving target populations have trouble partnering with the workforce system and becoming eligible training providers (ETPs).

6. WIOA programs do not provide sufficient supportive services to help customers overcome systemic barriers that disproportionately impact women, people of color, people with disabilities, and other groups.

Through its discussions, background readings, and consultations with state board staff in Colorado and California, the ETF also identified the following opportunities for the IWIB:

- Increase equity by centering the voices and experiences of workforce system customers in decisions impacting the design and quality of workforce system services.

- Leverage its leadership role better to push forward the state's workforce system equity efforts while empowering and supporting local workforce areas, workforce development leaders, and practitioners to feel ownership over this work.

- Establish an ongoing process for analyzing or diagnosing the impact of the design and implementation of policies on underserved and marginalized individuals and groups, as well as identify and potentially eliminate barriers.

Based on these insights, the Task Force identified recommendations in the following six categories. Detailed recommendations and next steps for each category are included in the report.

1. Build a culture of equity in the Illinois workforce system.

2. Integrate an equity lens into the work of the IWIB.

3. Invest in data analysis capacity, track disaggregated data and outcomes, and identify disparities and factors contributing to those disparities.

4. Diversify workforce system leadership and staff and provide systemwide training on equity, cultural competence, and cultural awareness and humility for those served by the system.

5. Provide funding to, and partner with, organizations providing culturally specific services with a track record of success in serving target populations.

6. Prioritize workforce services that include supportive services.

The Equity Task Force recommends that the IWIB adopt the Equity Task Force Report; create a standing Equity Committee to coordinate implementation of recommendations; and work with the governor, legislature, and state agencies to allocate resources necessary to develop and support the Equity Academy, data analysis, and local board activities identified in the report's recommendations.

About the Illinois Equity Taskforce

The Illinois workforce system[1] is charged with helping our most vulnerable populations gain skills and access good, family-supporting jobs. These jobseekers face significant barriers stemming from historical factors such as racial segregation and policies that banned women and people of color from accessing education and higher paid professions, as well as ongoing factors, like discriminatory hiring practices, incarceration, lack of affordable childcare, and disparities in generational wealth.[2] The uneven economic recovery from the pandemic has exacerbated these barriers. If our workforce system is to succeed in supporting these jobseekers along pathways to prosperity, it must disrupt these cycles of generational poverty and discrimination through equitable service design and delivery. We must also look beyond today's economy to the emerging jobs of the future and ensure that our education and workforce systems are helping all workers to access these jobs.

Helping these workers succeed benefits everyone. As the National Governors Association shared in its report, Creating a More Equitable Workforce System: Opportunities for Governors and States, research has shown that a more diverse workforce leads to higher economic growth, more participation in the consumer market, a more qualified workforce, and more creativity and innovation in business. Building on the work completed in 2019 to advance Governor Pritzker's equity and economic prosperity agenda, the Illinois Workforce Innovation Board (IWIB) created the Equity Task Force (ETF) in October 2020 to address equity within the Illinois workforce system and ensure that all customers are on pathways to success.

The Need

When it comes to educating, training, hiring, and advancing the Illinois workforce, some populations fare better than others. Women, people of color, people living with disabilities, rural area residents, justice-involved individuals, and other historically marginalized population groups do not have equitable access to economic prosperity. Analysis of education attainment and earnings data show disparities among workers that have significant implications for the state's economic competitiveness and undermine its goal of an Illinois economy that works for all its citizens. The three data sources below demonstrate these disparities.

---

[1] Illinois workNet provides a glossary of key workforce development terms at
https://www.illinoisworknet.com/WIOA/Resources/Pages/Glossary.aspx#:~:text=The%20WIOA%20final%20regulations%20promote%20increased%20public%20identification,the%20common%20identifier%20for%20the%20one-stop%20delivery%20system.
[2] National Equity Atlas. (n.d.). *Wages: $15/hr.* https://nationalequityatlas.org/indicators/Wages_15-hr#/?geo=01000000000000000

According to the Prosperity Now Scorecard, Illinois ranks 35 out of 50 states and the District of Columbia when it comes to racial disparities in relation to how well the state puts households of color on a pathway to economic prosperity. This rank is based on a state's economic measures for all residents but also accounts for racial disparities. Relative to other states, Illinois is about average for residents overall. The large gap between White residents and residents of color, however, drops the state's rank and has negative implications for the people and prosperity of Illinois. For example, the homeownership rate of White households is 75% compared with 39% for Black households and 54% for Latino households.[3]

Many quality jobs with family-sustaining wages in Illinois require a postsecondary degree or credential. To help ensure that Illinois has a pipeline of qualified workers to fill these jobs, the Illinois P-20 Council adopted a goal of 60% of adults aged 25–64 in the state holding a quality postsecondary degree or credential by 2025. Although much progress has been made, and the current credential attainment rate in Illinois is 55,[4] examining attainment by race/ethnicity reveals significant disparities. Even though 53% of White adults have a postsecondary degree, only 32% of African Americans and 24% of Latinx adults do (Exhibit 1). For bachelor's degrees, Illinois has the 11th largest gap of any state in attainment between African American and White adults and the 7th largest gap between Latinx and White adults.[5] The P-20 Council is currently developing equity targets aimed at closing these gaps, which it will embed within the state's attainment goal.

Exhibit 1. Credential Attainment in Illinois by Race/Ethnicity

Race/Ethnicity	Population	Credential attainment rate
White	4.16M	52.8%
Black	925K	31.7%
Hispanic	1.11M	22.5%
Asian-Pacific Islander	413K	74.3%
Native American/American Indian	7.22K	32.6%

Note. Sample: U.S. residents, ages 25–64. Credentials included graduate or professional degrees, bachelor's degrees, and associate degrees. Short-term credentials are excluded as data are not disaggregated by race or ethnicity. K = thousands; M = millions. Adapted from Lumina Foundation. (n.d.). *A stronger nation: Learning beyond high school builds American talent: We are tracking Illinois' progress.* https://www.luminafoundation.org/stronger-nation/report/#/progress/state/IL

---

[3] Prosperity Now Scorecard. (2020). *Data by location: Illinois.* https://scorecard.prosperitynow.org/data-by-location#state/il
[4] Lumina Foundation. (n.d.). *A stronger nation: Learning beyond high school builds American talent: We are tracking Illinois' progress.* https://www.luminafoundation.org/stronger-nation/report/#/progress/state/IL
[5] Illinois Board of Higher Education. (n.d.). *Data analysis: Postsecondary attainment in Illinois.* https://ibhestrategicplan.ibhe.org/SP_Data_Analysis.html#:~:text=According%20to%20the%20Lumina%20Foundation%2C%20Illinois%E2%80%99%20attainment%20is,African%20Americans%20and%2020%25%20of%20Latinx%20adults%20do

Additionally, there are significant earnings disparities in Illinois. Women earn less than men, and people of color earn less than Whites in Illinois, as shown in Exhibits 2 and 3. Women earn 75 cents on the dollar compared with men across the state (Exhibit 2). Black workers also earn 75 cents on the dollar, and Hispanic workers earn 68 cents on the dollar compared with White workers in Illinois (Exhibit 3).

Exhibit 2. Illinois Earnings Disparities by Sex

Sex	Number of workers	Share of workers	Average weekly earnings	Earnings per dollar
Male	3,245,961	53%	$1,144.16	$1.00
Female	2,925,289	47%	$854.40	$0.75

Note. Office of Federal Contract Compliance Programs. (n.d.). *Earnings disparities by sex.* U.S. Department of Labor. https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ofccp/about/data/earnings/gender

Exhibit 3. Illinois Earnings Disparity Relative to White Workers

Race/Ethnicity	Number of workers	Share of workers	Average weekly earnings	Earnings per dollar
White	3,973,694	64.39%	$1,096.62	$1.00
Black	709,542	11.50%	$818.17	$0.75
Native American/American Indian	4,623	0.07%	$637.76	$0.58
Asian-Pacific Islander	371,266	6.02%	$1,169.65	$1.07
Hispanic/Latino	1,053,968	17.08%	$751.06	$0.68
Multiracial	58,156	0.94%	$777.12	$0.71

Note. Office of Federal Contract Compliance Programs. (n.d.). *Earnings disparities by race and ethnicity.* U.S. Department of Labor. https://www.dol.gov/agencies/ofccp/about/data/earnings/race-and-ethnicity

Equity considerations in the workforce system extend past race and sex. Members of the LGBTQ+ community, people living with disabilities, returning citizens, and immigrants and refugees are among the diverse populations who experience significant barriers to accessing economic prosperity. For example, a 2018 analysis from the Prison Policy Initiative found that formerly incarcerated people experience an unemployment rate five times higher than the national rate.[6] As the state continues to change demographically, the urgency with which we

---

6 Coloute, L and Kopf, D. (2018, July). Out of Prison & Out of Work: Unemployment among formerly incarcerated people. https://www.prisonpolicy.org/reports/outofwork.html

must address these disparities continues to grow. If Illinois is to achieve real change and a prosperous economy, its workforce system must commit to a diverse and inclusive approach to equity.

Membership and Charge

The IWIB ETF includes 43 members who represent businesses, workforce partners, educators, and community advocates from historically marginalized populations. These members are dedicated to developing a framework of recommendations within the Illinois workforce and education system to establish goals and improve inequities for the populations the system is meant to serve. A full list of members is provided in Appendix A.

The IWIB charged the ETF with the following five key tasks:

1. creating shared definitions for a set of key terms to discuss and address equity;

2. establishing equity goals for the system;

3. identifying appropriate data tools that track program access and outcomes with disaggregated data by race, gender,[7] and age to reveal disparities;

4. recommending strategies to remove barriers to equity in programs, policies, and practices; and

5. recommending professional development and capacity-building strategies to ensure workforce system policymakers, funding agencies, and service delivery staff use an equity lens in serving diverse populations.

Organization and Approach

The ETF met bimonthly from October 2020 through May 2022. Three workgroups were established to carry out the work: Data, Policy, and Program. Each group met monthly beginning in November 2020.

- The Data Workgroup was tasked with identifying data tools that track program access and outcomes, as well as with analyzing the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA, P.L. 113-128) data disaggregated by race, sex, and age to reveal disparities. This group provided findings from its analysis to the policy and program workgroups to inform their work. The Data Workgroup also identified additional topics for future examination.

- The Policy Workgroup was tasked with recommending strategies to remove barriers to equity in programs, policies, and practices in the WIOA-funded workforce system.

---

[7] The Illinois workforce system currently collects data about sex (male, female, no answer). The Equity Task Force would like to advocate on behalf of the LGBQT+ community to collect data for sex and gender identity to encourage individuals to more fully complete intake forms for services.

- The Program Workgroup was tasked with recommending professional development and capacity-building strategies to ensure workforce system policymakers, funding agencies, and service delivery staff adopt an equity lens in serving diverse populations.

Appendices B, C, and D include the tasks for each workgroup, a summary of their process, and the workgroup's report.

Learning From Experts and Practitioners and Exploring Evidence-Based Practices

Task Force and workgroup meetings included presentations, recommended readings, and large and small group discussion. Task Force members consulted with several outside organizations and evidence-based practice reports over the course of its work:

- Dr. Sekile Nzinga, the first chief equity officer for Illinois, shared information about the Governor's Office of Equity and opportunities for alignment with statewide efforts.

- Ginger Ostro, executive director, gave a presentation on the Illinois Board of Higher Education's equity work, its impact, and lessons learned, with a focus on governance and procurement, as well as discussed opportunities for alignment and coordination.

- Ellen Johnson, facilitator of the Workforce Equity and Access Commission, provided an update on the commission's work and insights from the focus groups.

- Staff from the CA Workforce Board and the CO Workforce Board shared their promising practices in building statewide capacity to implement their state workforce equity initiatives.[8]

- National and local service providers, including the National Able Network and the Chicago-Cook Workforce Partnership, as well as ETF members representing local areas, shared their promising practices for identifying inequitable practices and implementing equitable ones.

- Our recommended readings can be found in Appendix C, which includes a bibliography of workforce system equity resources.

---

[8] See High Road Training Partnership Initiative. (2020). *The California high road: A road map to equity*. California Workforce Development Board. https://cwdb.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/43/2020/08/OneSheet_Equity_ACCESSIBLE.pdf. See also Colorado Workforce Development Council. (2021). *Colorado talent equity agenda*. https://cwdc.colorado.gov/talent-equity-agenda

What Does Equity Mean in the Illinois Workforce System?

Equity in the U.S. Economy

A recent report from the Federal Reserve Bank of San Francisco found that long-standing racial and ethnic disparities in the United States have hurt not only the people who experience the disparities but also all Americans by depressing U.S. economic output by trillions of dollars over the last 30 years.[9] The economic recession brought about by COVID-19 exacerbated these disparities. The unemployment rate remained in double digits for months, labor participation rates fell dramatically, and the economy changed due to business closures and modified business practices. Because of both historical and current labor market discrimination and occupational segregation, women and people of color were disproportionately impacted by the recession in part because they were overrepresented in the jobs hit hardest by the pandemic. As our economy recovers, the data show that the recovery has been inequitable as well, with women and people of color still experiencing worse labor market outcomes. Although the average 2021 Illinois unemployment rate was 6.0%, the Black unemployment rate was 12.3%, and the Latino unemployment rate was 6.9%. White women had the lowest unemployment rate at 4.7%, whereas Black men had the highest rate at 13.4%.[10]

The National Equity Atlas identified several drivers for these disparities. Wages on the lower end of the wage distribution are stagnant, causing a decline in the share of workers who can earn a living wage. This trend is driven by shifts in the U.S. economy, such as corporate outsourcing to countries with lower wages, stock buybacks in lieu of investment in workers, employer consolidation, and declines in union membership. Federal policy choices, such as fiscal austerity and a stagnant minimum wage, also contribute. These shifts, however, have disproportionately impacted women and people of color. These populations are overrepresented in low-paying jobs because of historical factors such as racial segregation and policies that banned women and people of color from accessing education and higher paid professions. Ongoing factors, like discriminatory hiring practices, lack of affordable childcare, and disparities in generational wealth, also contribute to wage stagnation.[11]

---

[9] Buckman, S., Choi, L., Daly, M., & Seitelman, L. (2021). *The economic gains from equity*. Federal Reserve Bank of San Francisco. https://doi.org/10.24148/wp2021-11

[10] U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics. (2022, January 28). *Local area unemployment statistics. States employment status of the civilian noninstitutional population by sex, race, Hispanic or Latino ethnicity, and detailed age, 2021 annual averages*. https://www.bls.gov/lau/ptable14full2021.htm

[11] National Equity Atlas. (n.d.). *Wages: $15/hr.* https://nationalequityatlas.org/indicators/Wages_15-hr#/?geo=01000000000000000

There has been increasing awareness of and response to inequality in the U.S. labor market. The public, private, and philanthropic sectors have invested resources in understanding this inequality and in developing, testing, and scaling potential solutions. As a result of this work, there is an emerging body of thought about what equity means in the workforce development ecosystem. For example, the National Fund for Workforce Solutions, which invests in a dynamic national network of approximately 30 communities taking a demand-driven, evidence-based approach to workforce development has done significant work in workforce equity (including in Chicagoland) and has developed the following definition.

> In an equitable workforce, all jobs are good jobs. Workforce equity means the elimination of racial gaps in employment and income such that the workforce—both public and private—is racially representative of the general population, at all different levels of skill and pay, across occupational groups and sectors.
>
> – *Advancing Workforce Equity: A Guide for Stakeholders | National Fund for Workforce Solutions*[12]

Although much of the national focus on workforce equity of late has focused on issues of race, we recognize that other factors, such as sex, gender identity,[13] disability status, and geographic location contribute to gaps in employment and income.

Role of the Public Workforce System

The workforce investment system has a key role to play in improving equity in educational and economic opportunity in America. The workforce system represents a significant investment in helping workers build their skills and find employment, especially during hard economic times, and it is thus uniquely positioned to disrupt cycles of generational poverty and discrimination.[14] The workforce system itself, however, runs the risk of perpetuating disparities in the labor market, as evidenced by Illinois outcomes data. For example, average quarterly earnings of Asian men two quarters after exit from the WIOA dislocated worker program were 39% higher ($15,872) than for Black men ($9,672).[15] Increasingly, workforce development leaders are recognizing that part of the solution must be identifying inequitable outcomes of the workforce system, exploring the cause of those inequities, and implementing solutions to advance equity within the system.

---

[12] National Fund for Workforce Solutions. (n.d.). *Advancing workforce equity: A guide for stakeholders.* https://nationalfund.org/workforce-equity-guide/?gclid=EAIaIQobChMIltCTrKjp9QIVCQOzAB03jQl3EAAYAyAAEgI1Y_D_BwE

[13] This report uses both the term "sex" and the term "gender identity" to mean two distinct things. Sex refers to a biological sex assignment at birth (male or female). Gender identity is one's psychological sense of gender (male, female, or nonbinary). WIOA collects and reports data on sex only.

[14] Minson, C. (2021, February 19). *The workforce development field or a conduit for maintaining systemic racism?* Federal Reserve Bank of Atlanta. https://doi.org/10.29338/wc2021-01

[15] See Appendix C, Attachment 4: WIOA Title I Data Analysis Methodology and Results

The workforce system is a dual-customer system, serving the needs of both jobseekers and businesses. State and local workforce boards work directly with businesses and industries to understand and address their workforce needs and support economic development. In that role, both state and local boards have an opportunity to collaborate with businesses to increase the diversity of their workforce and increase the availability of quality jobs and the supports workers need to succeed in them.[16]

The work of advancing equity in the workforce system takes place at every level. Although the governor, the state workforce board, and state agencies play important roles, local workforce boards, chief elected officials, American job centers, and frontline staff have equally critical roles to play. At these local and regional levels, staff and leaders design and provide services and have daily working relationships with both jobseekers and business customers.

The IWIB provides oversight and strategic leadership for the state workforce development system as funded by the WIOA. This includes the WIOA Title I Adult, Dislocated Worker, and Youth programs; the Title II Adult Education programs; the Title III Wagner Peyser program; and the Title IV Vocational Rehabilitation program. The system includes 22 workforce development boards that coordinate and leverage workforce strategies with education, economic development, and business stakeholders within their local communities, and 28 comprehensive workNet and 58 affiliate centers that deliver services to jobseekers and employers.[17] Total WIOA federal funding across all four titles for the IL workforce system was $312.3 million in FY2020, and the system served 127,590 jobseekers in PY2019.[18] These WIOA participants represent only a small fraction of the Illinois residents who would benefit from workforce system services.[19]

WIOA-funded programs are part of a broader education and workforce development ecosystem in Illinois that includes secondary and postsecondary education systems, including the IL Community College Board and the Illinois Board of Higher Education; Career and Technical Education (CTE); education and training programs funded and/or administered by the

---

[16] For an example of such collaboration, see Perkey, K. (n.d.). *The collaboration of workforce boards and business is key to equitable economic recovery*. National Association of Workforce Boards. https://www.nawb.org/the-collaboration-of-workforce-boards-and-business-is-key-to-equitable-economic-recovery

[17] For detailed explanation of WIOA and the one-stop service delivery system, see Congressional Research Service. (2021, January 21). *The Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act and the one-stop delivery system*. https://crsreports.congress.gov/product/pdf/R/R44252

[18] WIOA operates on a program year cycle from July to June. PY2019 represents data from July 1, 2019 to June 30, 2020. See Illinois Workforce Innovation Board. (2021, May). *Workforce Consolidation Feasibility Study: Designing a workforce system to improve customer access and outcomes*. https://www.illinoisworknet.com/WIOA/Resources/Documents/Workforce%20Consolidation%20Feasibility%20Study%202021.pdf

[19] See p. 36 of Illinois Workforce Innovation Board. (2021, May). *Workforce Consolidation Feasibility Study: Designing a workforce system to improve customer access and outcomes*. https://www.illinoisworknet.com/WIOA/Resources/Documents/Workforce%20Consolidation%20Feasibility%20Study%202021.pdf

Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program (SNAP), the Temporary Assistance for Needy Families (TANF) program, the ICCB, the Illinois Tollway, the IL Department of Transportation, the Capital Development Board, and the State Treasurer; Trade Adjustment Assistance (TAA); industry-driven sector strategies; registered apprenticeships; state- and private-sector job training programs; community-based organizations; and more.

Equity work undertaken by the IWIB must be aligned with this broader ecosystem of workforce development partners. The Inter-Agency Leadership Team, which is made up of the four WIOA title partners in Illinois,[20] has a critical role to play in this work through the coordination of strategic planning, policy, funding, technical assistance, and partnership activities.

Equity in the Illinois Workforce System

As outlined in the 2020–24 Illinois WIOA Unified State Plan, among the most serious barriers to economic prosperity for Illinois residents is a significant skills gap, and the plan notes that many programs that prepare individuals for the workplace too often ignore the harsh economic realities lived by low-income populations. The IWIB 2020–22 strategic plan states that, "Equitable access is a fundamental principle within WIOA, the Illinois WIOA Unified Plan, as well as a high priority of the governor. The work of the IWIB is to establish goals to improve inequities for the populations we serve, create accessible career pathways for all customers that address barriers to employment, and enhance equality among partners."[21] One step in achieving that goal was for the IWIB to develop the ETF.

The ETF took a broad view of equity to guide its work. The populations it considered in its scope included women, people of color, individuals with disabilities, the LGBTQ+ community, veterans, justice-impacted populations, immigrant populations, rural residents, homeless and homeless youth, low-income individuals, foster care youth and alumni, migrant and seasonal workers, individuals working to achieve their high school equivalency, persons receiving public assistance, and individuals who are basic skills deficient.

> **Our Definition of Equity**
>
> **"The state, quality, or ideal of being just, impartial, and fair.** The concept of equity is synonymous with fairness and justice. To be achieved and sustained, equity needs to be thought of as a structural and systemic concept."
>
> *Source: Annie E. Casey Foundation.*

---

[20] The four WIOA Title Partners: Illinois Department of Commerce and Economic Opportunity (DCEO): Title I: Workforce Development Activities; Illinois Community College Board (ICCB): Title II: Adult Education and Literacy; Illinois Department of Employment Security (IDES): Title III: Amendments to the Wagner-Peyser Act; Illinois Department of Human Services Division of Rehabilitation Services (IDHS-DRS): Title IV: Vocational Rehabilitation Services.

[21] Illinois Workforce Innovation Board. (2020, September). *2020 – 2022 IWIB Strategic Plan* (p. 5). https://www.illinoisworknet.com/WIOA/Resources/Documents/2020_2022%20APPROVED%20IWIB%20Strategic%20Plan%20.pdf

The workgroup was charged with developing equity-related definitions and used three terms to guide its work: "Equity," "Equity Lens," and "Cultural Competence." The ETF defined equity using the Annie E. Casey Foundation's definition.[22] It defines equity as *the state, quality, or ideal of being just impartial and fair.* This conceptualization is synonymous with fairness and justice. It is not simply a desired state or lofty value. Rather, to be achieved and sustained, equity needs to be thought of as a structural and systemic concept.

The ETF's understanding of the definition of equity was bolstered by exploring how the Annie E. Casey foundation's definition contrasts equity with equality. Equity involves trying to understand what people need to enjoy full, healthy lives and help them obtain it, whereas equality aims to ensure that everyone gets the same things to enjoy full, healthy lives. The Annie E. Casey foundation also considers equity in the context of systems. Systematic equity is a robust system and dynamic process that reinforces and replicates equitable ideas, power, resources, strategies, conditions, habits, and outcomes. It is this systemic equity that the ETF believes the IL workforce system must strive for.

Our Working Definition of an Equity Lens

An equity lens is "*an ongoing process for analyzing or diagnosing the impact of the design and implementation of policies on under-served and marginalized individuals and groups, and to identify and potentially eliminate barriers.*"

Source: Minnesota State Office of Equity and Inclusion

The ETF's work is guided by the concept of an **equity lens**. The ETF's working definition for equity lens is "*an ongoing process for analyzing or diagnosing the impact of the design and implementation of policies on under-served and marginalized individuals and groups, and to identify and potentially eliminate barriers.*" This definition is drawn from the work of Minnesota State Office of Equity and Inclusion,[23] where they use it to guide their policy analysis work. The ETF found that this working definition, with its focus on process and action, embodies the spirit of proactive, ongoing work necessary to achieve and maintain equity.

The ETF found that the term "equity," and even the broader phrase "diversity, equity, inclusion, and access," was not sufficient for its work. The ETF also considered the concept of **cultural competence**. Cultural competence, as understood by Cross et al.,[24] means a set of values, behaviors, attitudes, and practices within a system, organization, program, or among individuals that enables them to work effectively cross culturally. It requires that organizations and individuals do the following:

---

[22] Annie E. Casey Foundation. (2015, January 8). *Race equity and inclusion action guide*. https://www.aecf.org/resources/race-equity-and-inclusion-action-guide

[23] Minnesota State Office of Equity and Inclusion. (n.d.). *Applying an equity lens to policy review*. https://www.minnstate.edu/system/equity/docs/Equity-Lens-to-Policy-Review1.pdf

[24] Cross, T., Bazron, B., Dennis, K., & Isaacs, M. (1989). *Towards a culturally competent system of care* (Vol. 1). CASSP Technical Assistance Center, Center for Child Health and Mental Health Policy, Georgetown University Center for Child and Human Development, CASSP Technical Assistance Center.

- have a defined set of values and principles, and demonstrate behaviors, attitudes, policies, and structures that enable them to work effective cross-culturally;

- have the capacity to (a) value diversity, (b) conduct self-assessment, (c) manage the dynamics of difference, (d) acquire and institutionalize cultural knowledge, and (e) adapt to diversity and the cultural contexts of communities they serve; and

- incorporate the above in all aspects of policymaking, administration, practice, and service delivery, systematically involving consumers, families, and communities.

Acquiring cultural competence is a developmental process that evolves over an extended period. Both individuals and organizations are at various levels of awareness, knowledge, and skills along the cultural competence continuum. The complexity of achieving cultural competence does not allow for a "how to," step-by-step process for getting there. The process of achieving cultural competency occurs along a continuum and sets forth six stages from cultural destructiveness to cultural proficiency (see Footnote 24). Moving along the continuum takes conscious effort and should be an ongoing process for IL workforce system leaders and staff. Exhibit 4 provides more information about the six stages of the cultural competence continuum.

Exhibit 4. Cultural Competence Continuum

Cultural Destructiveness	Intentional attitudes, policies, and practices that are destructive to cultures & individuals within a culture
Cultural Incapacity	A lack of capacity to help different cultural groups due to biased beliefs against anything outside of mainstream culture
Cultural Blindness	Maintains that the dominant culture's approach is universally applicable, ignores cultural strengths, and encourages assimilation.
Cultural Precompetence	Incorporates culturally relevant and welcoming imagery, employing people representative of the population being served.
Cultural Competence	Acceptance and respect for difference, continued self-assessment, expansion of knowledge, and adaptation.
Cultural Proficiency	Deliberate inclusiveness & regular assessment of responsiveness to cultural needs of staff and people served.

Note. Adapted from Cross, T., Bazron, B., Dennis, K., & Isaacs, M. (1989). *Towards a culturally competent system of care* (Vol. 1). CASSP Technical Assistance Center, Center for Child Health and Mental Health Policy, Georgetown University Center for Child and Human Development, CASSP Technical Assistance Center.

What Did the Task Force Learn About the Current State of Equity in Illinois and in the Illinois Workforce System?

The ETF undertook the following activities to understand the current state of equity in Illinois and the Illinois workforce system:

- Review of existing analyses of WIOA-funded program data, including the 2021 IWIB report "Designing a Workforce System to Improve Customer Access and Outcomes" (see Footnote 19).

- Completion of new analysis of participant data for clients enrolled statewide in WIOA-funded programs from July 1, 2019 to June 30, 2020 (PY2019). The workgroups examined data disaggregated by sex and race/ethnicity and used a disparate impact analysis method. Disparate impact analysis can be used to surface policies and procedures that adversely affect a particular class of people, based on such traits as their race, color, or religion, even if they are not intended to be discriminatory.

- Discussion with ETF members who are practitioners and direct service providers about the challenges and successes they experienced firsthand in providing equitable services to IL jobseekers.

- Review of insights gathered from focus groups by the Illinois Governor's Commission on Workforce Equity and Access. ETF co-leads and facilitators reviewed materials produced by the Equity Commission to ensure that ETF insights and recommendations align with the experiences shared by staff, customers, and jobseekers in Equity Commission listening sessions.

Key Insights Gained by the ETF

As a result of the reviews and analysis undertaken by the ETF workgroups, the ETF gained the following nine insights that informed the development of its recommendations:

1. ***WIOA programs generally appear to be reaching the at-risk populations the workforce system is intended to serve; however, some customers experience greater barriers than others.***

   The 2021 IWIB report "Designing a Workforce System to Improve Customer Access and Outcomes" (see Footnote 17) examined participant demographics for all WIOA programs in Illinois compared with a representative target population as a high-level assessment of the equitable delivery of services. That report found that WIOA programs generally appear to be reaching the at-risk populations the workforce system is intended to serve.

When the ETF looked at what barriers to employment[25] case managers in the WIOA Title I Adult program use to qualify jobseekers for services, however, we observed that women and people of color had more barriers identified and at higher rates. For example, Black women in the WIOA Title I Adult program are much more likely to be identified as recipients of TANF and SNAP benefits and as low income. Black men are much more likely to be identified as ex-offenders. White women and Black women are more likely to be identified as single parents. Participants of color are more likely than White participants to be identified as basic skills deficient (Exhibit 5). This raises questions about whether the system provides effective and more intensive services to customers with employment barriers to help them achieve equitable employment and earnings outcomes.

Exhibit 5. Title I Adult Participants, Barriers to Employment* Identified at Program Intake

Barrier	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
TANF	1.4%	**3.3%**	1.0%	0.3%	0.2%	0.2%	0.1%	0.3%
SSI	0.8%	**1.0%**	0.5%	0.6%	0.2%	0.8%	0.2%	0.3%
SNAP	38.8%	**58.5%**	39.7%	15.4%	18.8%	40.1%	20.8%	16.3%
Homeless	0.6%	0.7%	0.5%	0.6%	0.9%	**1.6%**	0.7%	0.3%
Ex-offender	3.4%	4.0%	2.6%	0.3%	8.1%	**18.7%**	6.8%	0.3%
Low income	48.4%	**64.4%**	47.3%	34.9%	26.0%	49.3%	28.8%	28.9%
English language learner	0.6%	1.3%	1.2%	**25.9%**	0.7%	0.9%	1.2%	17.7%
Basic skills deficient	18.9%	29.0%	28.9%	**40.4%**	14.7%	30.2%	22.2%	28.0%
Cultural barrier	0.4%	1.1%	0.4%	**15.7%**	0.3%	0.6%	0.3%	12.6%
Single parent	**22.5%**	19.7%	13.5%	4.7%	1.8%	3.0%	1.7%	0.3%

Note. SNAP = Supplemental Nutrition Assistance Program; SSI = Supplemental Security Income; TANF = Temporary Assistance for Needy Families.
**Definitions for these employment barrier categories can be found in Illinois state WIOA policy* here*. Barriers to employment are determined at the point of entry into the program.*

---

[25] WIOA defines these factors as "barriers to employment;" however, it is important to note that receiving TANF and SNAP, being low-income, and/or being a single parent are not necessarily barriers to employment. Rather, WIOA uses these factors as proxies for challenges with transportation, resources, availability for unpaid training, and so on. The narrative in the workforce system that suggests receiving certain benefits and having certain circumstances are themselves barriers creates a false narrative about public benefits and individual's lives and should be addressed both in Illinois and nationally as part of our equity work.

2. *There are differences in employment and earnings outcomes by race in the WIOA Adult, Dislocated Worker, and Youth programs, but it is difficult to isolate the impact of the WIOA programs from other socioeconomic factors that impact employment and earnings.*

Participants in the WIOA Adult and Dislocated Worker programs are employed at approximately the same rate two quarters after exit, regardless of race or sex, but earnings outcomes differ for each program. In the Adult program, average earnings two quarters after exit vary by race and sex by less than 15% (Exhibit 6). By contrast, average earnings for Dislocated Worker completers vary significantly by race. For example, Asian men earn 39% more than Black men and Asian women earn 45% more than Black women (Exhibit 7).

Exhibit 6. Title I Adult Participants, Percentage Employed Two Quarters After Program Exit and Average Quarterly Earnings Two Quarters After Program Exit

Outcomes	Female				Male			
	White	**Black**	**Hispanic**	**Asian**	**White**	**Black**	**Hispanic**	**Asian**
Percent employed	**86.4%**	86.0%	86.1%	79.8%	77.9%	75.3%	78.4%	72.0%
Average quarterly earnings	**$7,352**	$6,367	$6,540	$6,687	$6,842	$6,232	$7,066	$7,137

Exhibit 7. Title I Dislocated Worker Participants, Percentage Employed Two Quarters After Program Exit and Average Quarterly Earnings Two Quarters After Program Exit

Outcomes	Female				Male			
	White	**Black**	**Hispanic**	**Asian**	**White**	**Black**	**Hispanic**	**Asian**
Percent employed	86.0%	87.4%	**88.9%**	84.0%	87.1%	84.3%	84.8%	78.0%
Average quarterly earnings	$9,435	$8,656	$8,815	$15,807	$12,456	$9,679	$10,495	**$15,972**

Note. Numbers in green indicate the highest average earnings by group and constitute the reference group. Numbers in red are 85% or less of the reference group and indicate disparate impact (see Appendix C, Attachment 4: WIOA Title I Data Analysis Methodology and Results).

In the Youth program, there are differences in employment outcomes by race and sex. Asian youth enter employment at rates much lower than those of their peers in other races. Hispanic male youth earn 34% more than Asian male youth, whereas Hispanic female youth earn 64% more than Asian female youth (Exhibit 8).

Exhibit 8. Title I Youth Participants, Percentage Employed Two Quarters After Program Exit and Average Quarterly Earnings Two Quarters After Program Exit

Outcomes	Female				Male			
	White	**Black**	**Hispanic**	**Asian**	**White**	**Black**	**Hispanic**	**Asian**
Percent employed	77.4%	**81.0%**	79.4%	40.5%	75.2%	71.9%	77.5%	45.6%
Average quarterly earnings	$3,225	$3,445	$3,639	$1,281	$3,461	$3,287	**$4,232**	$2,753

Note. Numbers in green indicate the highest average earnings by group and constitute the reference group. Numbers in red are 85% or less of the reference group and indicate disparate impact (see Appendix C, Attachment 4: WIOA Title I Data Analysis Methodology and Results).

The ETF was not able to isolate the impact of WIOA services from other socioeconomic factors that contribute to employment and earnings outcomes for women and people of color based on analysis of WIOA participant data alone. As noted in the introduction, employer equal opportunity practices, access to high-quality schools, transportation, affordable childcare, and housing near job centers, as well as credit checks are all factors that also impact employment and earnings.

3. *Participants' sex and race influence which services they access and which occupations they train in.*

Some groups access services at much higher rates than other groups, which likely has implications not only for programmatic outcomes but also potentially has longer term employment and wage impacts. For the WIOA Title I Adult program, White women are significantly more likely to receive all types of services relative to all other groups (Exhibit 9).

Exhibit 9. Title I Adult Percentage of Participants by Service Type

Type of service	Female				Male			
	White	**Black**	**Hispanic**	**Asian**	**White**	**Black**	**Hispanic**	**Asian**
Self-services	43.2%	33.0%	27.9%	23.4%	33.2%	27.9%	21.9%	24.0%
Staff services	64.5%	45.3%	47.1%	47.7%	54.0%	44.2%	46.2%	52.0%
Received training	85.0%	70.1%	74.8%	51.4%	79.8%	74.1%	80.1%	68.6%
Training completed	77.7%	76.7%	77.1%	81.3%	81.1%	79.3%	82.8%	94.2%

The workgroup also found a strong relationship between sex and the occupation in which participants receive training. For WIOA Adult participants with a high school education or less, approximately 65% of females entered training in healthcare practitioner or healthcare support roles and approximately 66% of males entered training in transportation (predominantly truck driving) or production. Nearly 70% of Black men with a high school education or less were trained in transportation. Such occupational segregation has impacts on earnings and career advancement potential given the structures within those industries (Exhibit 10).

Exhibit 10. Title I Adult Percentage of Participants by Occupational Focus of Training

Type of service	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
Received training, total	40.5%	44.8%	48.8%	27.5%	54.0%	55.6%	62.3%	29.7%
Management	1.4%	6.7%	2.9%	38.3%	1.0%	2.6%	1.0%	23.1%
Computer and mathematical	1.9%	2.3%	2.6%	1.7%	5.6%	3.2%	3.7%	0.0%
Healthcare practitioners and technical	**41.3%**	**41.1%**	**23.9%**	**35.0%**	3.3%	2.2%	2.9%	1.9%
Healthcare support	**29.1%**	**24.5%**	**33.5%**	**5.0%**	1.8%	0.7%	1.0%	0.0%
Office and administrative support	4.1%	3.1%	6.8%	6.7%	1.6%	2.9%	2.0%	0.0%
Installation, maintenance, and repair	1.0%	0.2%	0.6%	0.0%	12.1%	3.6%	8.8%	7.7%
Production	7.9%	3.6%	11.9%	8.3%	**19.6%**	**12.6%**	**22.6%**	**34.6%**
Transportation and material moving	8.3%	11.7%	12.6%	1.7%	**49.5%**	**69.3%**	**55.8%**	**26.9%**
All other	4.9%	6.7%	5.2%	3.3%	5.5%	2.9%	2.2%	5.8%

These data suggest that the Illinois workforce system has room to grow in its equity practices relative to delivering services and ensuring participants are equitably supported to explore and enter into career pathways with growth and advancement opportunities.

4. Although the ETF was able to identify some insights from WIOA data, the process highlighted that *the current infrastructure, staffing, and systems in Illinois for collecting and analyzing WIOA data are not designed to support robust analysis of disaggregated data.*

Data analysis requires time, resources, and skilled staff, including specialized staff to design, analyze, and make use of collected data in support of equity goals. The ETF found that state agency staff has limited resources available to produce analyses disaggregated by race, gender, disability status, geography, and other relevant demographics, given their other reporting requirements and limitations of the data collected. Furthermore, these analyses are not available to the public; neither are they available to local workforce areas, who must find the capacity to do such analyses on their own.

Furthermore, data collected as part of WIOA reporting requirements are not sufficient to allow Illinois to understand equity impacts on all groups. For example, the workforce system collects data on sex but not on gender identity or sexuality. As another example, the federal government officially categorizes people with origins in Lebanon, Iran, Egypt, and other countries in the Middle East and North Africa (MENA) region as White. Although those of MENA origin report discrimination in housing, work, and other parts of daily life, it is not possible to isolate these individuals in the data to better understand their experience.[26] Because of these gaps in data collection, ETF was not able to use data to answer questions about how many LGBTQ+ or MENA-identifying individuals the system serves or what services they receive. Furthermore, the ETF discussed the possibility that some target populations (especially where those experiences/identities intersect) are underreported in the current system because the system prioritizes qualifying customers quickly over thorough demographic data collection.

Finally, the workgroup found that quantitative data alone are not sufficient to understand equity in the workforce system. Data analysis suggested aspects of WIOA service delivery that would benefit from further investigation, but such work would require the regular collection and analysis of qualitative data, including interviews with staff, customers, service delivery providers, and jobseekers who do not access workforce system services.

---

[26] Wang, H. (2022, February 17). *The U.S. census sees Middle Eastern and Norther African people as white. Many don't*. WBEZ Chicago. https://www.wbez.org/stories/the-us-census-sees-middle-eastern-and-north-african-people-as-white-many-dont/15737739-8d37-4c59-8b60-3413b56ea212

5. *The IWIB has the tremendous opportunity to establish an ongoing process for analyzing or diagnosing the impact of the design and implementation of policies on underserved and marginalized individuals and groups, as well as to identify and potentially eliminate barriers.*

Although the work of the Continuous Improvement Committee has included some equity factors in the design of evaluations, the IWIB does not routinely, systematically, and formally factor equity considerations into its policy, budget, procedure, and program development processes.

6. *The IWIB can increase equity by centering the voices and experiences of workforce system customers in decisions impacting the design and quality of workforce system services.*

Centering the voices of women, people of color, people with disabilities, and others with lived experiences of navigating employment barriers is a necessary part of achieving equity. This can partially be accomplished by assembling a diverse group of public workforce system stakeholders across various levels of leadership to participate in equity-advancing work. It also requires examining and, if necessary, increasing the diversity of workforce system leadership and frontline staff. The 22 workforce boards in Illinois, and the many community businesses represented on them, must embrace a commitment to equity in order for our efforts to succeed. Given the roles of leaders and staff in deciding which career pathways and key workforce strategies to prioritize, the leadership of workforce boards and American job centers should reflect the communities they serve, and those with hiring and board nomination roles should consider whether women, people of color, people with disabilities, as well as workers are appropriately represented.[27] Because the pool of diverse candidates with the decision-making authority required of state and local board members can be small, leaders can struggle to achieve board diversity goals.

7. *Organizations providing culturally specific services with a track record of success in serving target populations have trouble partnering with the workforce system and becoming eligible training providers (ETPs).*

The Policy Workgroup spent considerable time discussing the challenges such organizations encounter,[28] including cumbersome WIOA registration processes for clients, lack of information about how to become ETPs, and ETP criteria that do not take into consideration

---

[27] Amuh, D., Bustillo, D., Minson, C., & Shevlin, P. (2021, June 28). *Guest Post: Seven Recommendations to Advance Racial Equity in the Workforce System*. Workforce Matters Funders Network. https://workforce-matters.org/guest-post-seven-recommendations-to-advance-racial-equity-in-the-workforce-system/

[28] Although there is no established definition of culturally competent organizations in the workforce development field, organizational checklists developed for the human service and healthcare sectors can be adapted to give a good sense of the characteristics of such organizations. For an example, see Ad Hoc Committee of the Association of University Centers on Disabilities (AUCD) Multicultural Council. (2004). *Instructions for assessment of organizational cultural competence*. https://www.aucd.org/docs/councils/mcc/cultural_competency_assmt2004.pdf

the ability of training providers to serve key customer populations. Community-based organizations have a sense that the large proportion of community colleges on the list of ETPs makes it challenging for customers to make informed choices about smaller providers.

8. ***WIOA programs rarely provide sufficient supportive services to help customers overcome systemic barriers that disproportionately impact women, people of color, people with disabilities, and other groups.***

This lack of support prevents them from participating in and benefiting from workforce services, including education and training programs that lead to good jobs with sustaining wage levels. Women, particularly Black and Latina women, face a range of barriers, including lack of adequate childcare, lack of transportation, juggling work and family responsibilities, and on-the-job discrimination, that impact their ability to find and keep a job with decent wages and advancement opportunities.[29] Studies in community college settings have shown that providing students with a wide range of supports, including transportation, childcare, and career counseling, improves their performance and subsequent labor market outcomes.[30] Well-studied workforce programs with high impacts on earnings have higher per-participant costs.[31] The desire to keep the cost per participant served low can be at odds with prioritizing programming that includes supports that are needed to effectively serve jobseekers, something the IWIB needs to consider in policy and budget development.

9. ***The IWIB can better leverage its leadership role to push forward the state's workforce system equity efforts*** while empowering and supporting local workforce areas, workforce development leaders, and practitioners to feel ownership over this work as well.

The work necessary to increase equity in the workforce system must be done at both the organizational and the individual level, and the IWIB has the opportunity to build buy-in and capacity across the state to do this work well.

---

[29] National Partnership for Women and Families. (n.d.). *Detours on the road to employment: Obstacles facing low-income women*. https://www.nationalpartnership.org/our-work/resources/more/economic-security/detours-road-employment.pdf

[30] Abdul Latif Jameel Poverty Action Lab. (2020, May). Reducing community college dropout through comprehensive supports. *J-PAL Policy Insights*. https://doi.org/10.31485/pi.2593.2020

[31] Katz, L., Roth, J., Hendra, R., & Schaberg, K. (2020, December). *Why do sectoral employment programs work? Lessons from WorkAdvance.* National Bureau of Economic Research. https://www.nber.org/system/files/working_papers/w28248/w28248.pdf

How Is Illinois Already Working Toward an Equitable Workforce Development System?

Although the ETF identified several barriers and opportunities related to equity in the Illinois workforce system, it also found examples of a strong commitment to equity and promising practices that the system can leverage to advance its equity work. The IWIB is an important contributor and leader in these efforts, and ongoing communication, coordination, and collaboration across these efforts will be critical to maximizing their impact.

State Efforts

The ETF applauds the state for showing leadership in recognizing the importance of building an equitable workforce development system. In January 2019, Governor Pritzker issued Executive Order 2019-03, which directed Illinois state agencies to review current and potential industries targeted for economic growth and recommend how workforce resources can be better aligned to serve disenfranchised populations in communities throughout Illinois. Since then, several efforts have been made to center equity, diversity, and inclusion at the state level.

In response to the governor's executive order, the four agencies that play the most prominent roles in Illinois workforce development efforts prepared an agenda to create opportunities for state residents. "An Action Agenda for Workforce Development and Job Creation"[32] includes specific strategies and action steps dedicated to setting and supporting goals toward increased equity within workforce development.

In October 2019, the Illinois Department of Commerce & Economic Opportunity (ILDCEO) released "A Plan to Revitalize the Illinois Economy and Build the Workforce of the Future,"[33] which outlines a vision to reinvigorate the Illinois economy and spur economic growth. Its ambitious agenda includes a priority to "reduce the Equity Gap by investing in, providing support to, and taking down barriers for economically disadvantaged populations."

Progress in reducing the equity gap is measured by tracking average earnings relative to the statewide average for the following populations:

---

[32] Illinois Department of Commerce and Economic Opportunity. (2019, April). *An Agenda for workforce development and job creation: Response to Illinois Executive Order 2019-03*. https://www2.illinois.gov/dceo/whyillinois/Documents/EO3_Full_Report_04.14.19.pdf

[33] Illinois Department of Commerce and Economic Opportunity. (2019, October). *A plan to revitalize the Illinois economy and build the workforce of the future: Executive summary*. https://www2.illinois.gov/dceo/Documents/IllinoisEconomicPlan2019ExecSumm.10.8.2019.pdf. Quoted text on page 2.

- women
- rural residents
- people of color
- people with disabilities
- veterans
- justice-impacted populations
- immigrant populations

The 2020–24 Illinois WIOA Unified State Plan outlines ways in which Illinois aims to address inequities in postsecondary education and training, access to stable infrastructure that allows for necessary supportive services, and access to adult education and literacy. The plan also explains the ways in which the Department of Commerce Office of Equal Opportunity Monitoring and Compliance (EOMC) continually addresses issues of inequity and discrimination. EOMC is responsible for monitoring program and physical accessibility issues for WIOA-funded activities supported by the Office of Employment and Training. In 2018, the EOMC developed an agreement to better manage the Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA, 42 U.S.C. § 12101) monitoring process of American job centers.

Elsewhere in the Illinois education and workforce development ecosystem, Illinois' Perkins V Transition Plan (SFY2020)[34] incorporated equity as a key theme, including the Pathways to Results plan, which is described as "an outcomes-focused, equity-guided process designed to improve pathways that support student transition to and through postsecondary education and employment" that assists CTE practitioners with "developing, implementing, and evaluating programs of study with an equity lens often identifying barriers that prevent access and persistence of special populations or other marginalized student groups."

The state's Workforce Equity Initiative (WEI)[35] is putting some of the state's equity plans into action by creating, supporting, and expanding short-term workforce (credit and/or noncredit) training opportunities in higher education communities focused on specific sectors with identified workforce gaps. The grant requires a minimum of 60% of the students served to be African American students. The overall goal is to accelerate the time for the individuals to enter and succeed in postsecondary education/training programs that lead to employment in high-skilled, high-wage, and in-demand occupations (see Footnote 19).

---

[34] Illinois State Board of Education and Illinois Community College Board. (2019). *Illinois' Perkins V Transition Plan (SFY2020)* (p. 10). https://www.isbe.net/Documents/Illinois-Perkins-Transition-Plan.pdf
[35] Workforce Equity Initiative. https://www.illinoiswei.org/

The Illinois Board of Higher Education recently completed an equity-focused strategic planning process that included eight recommended strategies that incorporate data-driven and best practices that help to address the persistent equity gaps in higher education and lay the framework for an aligned higher education system that serves students independent of the path they take.[36]

In February 2021, the Illinois State Legislature voted on and passed the Commission on Equity and Inclusion Act, creating the Governor's Commission on Workforce Equity and Access, which will advise and provide support on issues involving diversity, inclusion, and equity, including hiring and training, as well as perhaps suggest legislation to further its mission. The ETF has several members that also serve on the Commission, and we have coordinated our work.

Local Efforts

Work is also going on in local workforce areas to increase equity within the WIOA system, both at the board level and at the workNet operator level. We provide some examples below, but the ETF did not conduct an exhaustive search.

Workforce Area 3, under the leadership of the Workforce Connection, conducted an analysis of its WIOA Title I services with a focus on equity. This report provided the local workforce board with a detailed analysis of participant services and outcomes, disaggregated by sex, race, and ethnicity. The results will be used to guide future policies and investments.

In Workforce Area 1, the Lake County Workforce Development Board convened its own ETF with a charge similar to that of the IWIB ETF. LCWDB defined a "key imperative of creating a culture of equitable prosperity" and in 2021 hosted a series of extensive, in-depth diversity, equity, and inclusion training opportunities for board and committee members via a series of Inclusive Leadership Institute (ILI) workshops.

In Workforce Area 7, workforce system leaders and practitioners are benefiting from a report developed by the National Equity Atlas in partnership with Burning Glass Technologies, the National Fund for Workforce Solutions, and the Chicagoland Workforce Funder Alliance, which offers a comprehensive analysis of long-standing racial gaps in labor market outcomes, the economic impacts of COVID-19, and the racial equity implications of automation in the Chicagoland area.

---

[36] Illinois Board of Higher Education. (2020). *Strategies for a thriving Illinois equity: Equity strategies*. https://ibhestrategicplan.ibhe.org/SP_Equity_Strategies.html

Equity Goals and Recommendations

The IWIB has already stated its goals of improving inequities for the populations served across the IL workforce system, creating accessible career pathways for all customers that address barriers to employment, and enhancing equality among partners.

The ETF recommends that the IWIB adopt the following short-term goals in pursuit of its broader equity work:

1. Ensure that leaders and practitioners in the IL workforce system have the information, data, training, and skills they need to understand the equity challenges workforce system customers face and the tools they need to enhance equity in the workforce system.

2. Adopt practices within the IWIB itself to incorporate an equity lens into the work that we do.

Recommendations

The ETF has identified six broad areas of action for the IWIB, along with specific steps within those areas of action. For each area of action, we have provided recommendations for the IWIB. Because local workforce boards and service providers play an equally critical role in advancing equity, we have also identified opportunities for them in each area of action.

	1. Build a culture of equity in the Illinois workforce system.
	2. Integrate an equity lens into the work of the IWIB.
	3. Invest in data analysis capacity, track disaggregated data and outcomes, and identify disparities and factors contributing to those disparities.
	4. Diversify workforce system leadership and staff and provide systemwide training on equity, cultural competence, and cultural awareness and humility for those served by the system.
	5. Provide funding to, and partner with, organizations providing culturally specific services with a track record of success in serving target populations.
	6. Prioritize workforce services that include supportive services.

1. Build a culture of equity in the Illinois workforce system.

The IWIB has an opportunity to lead the state's workforce system equity efforts while empowering and supporting local workforce boards and workforce development leaders and practitioners to feel ownership over this work.

Recommended Actions

- **Train the trainers to educate local workforce leadership** on tools, practices, approaches, and so on. Train them on how to train the rest of the system.

- **Recognize local workforce areas** that are effective in reaching out to, recruiting, and serving target populations.

- Encourage public workforce system leaders to **support employers with tools to advance equity**. This could include the following:

  - educating employer partners about training in equity and quality jobs;[37]

  - encouraging approaches that "prepare jobs for people" in addition to "preparing people for jobs," and support employer partners in doing the same;[38]

  - building partnerships with businesses in emerging industries and helping them develop a diverse pipeline of workers that include workforce system customers; and

  - prioritizing partnerships with business that demonstrate a commitment to equity through practices such as:

    » providing equity training to leadership, managers, and staff;

    » developing and implementing practices that will increase sustainable placement for women, workers of color, and workers with disabilities, such as new-hire cohorts and culturally competent management strategies; and

    » aligning employment opportunities that provide a living wage.

- **Build capacity through technical assistance.** Technical assistance (TA) supports help systems and organizations attain broad goals and address complex issues. It can take the form of training, coaching, educating, problem-solving, and otherwise supporting relevant stakeholders. TA can help ensure that organizations and systems that interact with individual practitioners (e.g., funding, time, and policies) are addressed and that systems are developed to improve, sustain, and regenerate the competencies of case managers and

---

[37] Find more job quality resources here: San Diego Workforce Partnership. (n.d.). *How to build job quality into your workforce development approach*. https://workforce.org/job-quality-wkdev-guide/

[38] Heartland Alliance. (n.d.). *Five things public workforce systems should do now to advance racial equity*. https://www.heartlandalliance.org/five-things-public-workforce-systems-should-do-now-to-advance-racial-equity/

other frontline staff. To fund this important work, the IWIB should recommend to the governor and state WIOA agencies that 1 percent of state WIOA funds is set aside to design and deliver an Equity Academy. Activities would include the following:

- **Developing and disseminating an equity assessment tool.** The [Ready for Equity in Workforce Development Racial Equity Readiness Assessment](#) Tool[39] developed by Race Forward and the Center for Social Inclusion is one example of a tool that could be used or modified to help workforce development organizations and practitioners to evaluate their programs, operations, and culture to identify strength areas and growth opportunities. Practitioners can use this toolkit to familiarize themselves with various practices and policies that support institutional racial equity, evaluate their current efforts, and plan action steps.

- **Providing cohort-based learning opportunities** in which local workforce areas analyze their disaggregated data, listen to their customers, identify potential changes to their programs and service delivery models, and implement those changes. Peer-to-peer learning like this can significantly enhance capacity in the state.

- **Coaching regional workforce areas on how to develop regional plans that center equity**. Tools developed by the IWIB to support its equity work (see next recommendation area) could be adapted to guide such coaching.

- **Creating a community of practice for stakeholders** to set in motion plans for addressing inequity in their organizations and in the people they serve. Modeled after a similar activity led by the Colorado Workforce Development Council, this community of practice could offer a flexible opportunity for stakeholder organizations to reflect on the journey of their equity work, honor where their organization is on that journey, and provide support for organizations to take the next step. This would help the IWIB identify equity-minded workforce development organizations in the state and support and lift up their work.

- **Provide competitive grants** to organizations that pilot and (when ready) take to scale service delivery models that advance equity. California is taking this approach with its [High Road Training Partnerships](#).[40]

> **Opportunities for Local Areas**
>
> Local workforce boards and workNET operators can help build a culture of equity in the Illinois workforce system by participating in technical assistance activities, engaging board members in training and discussions about equity, convening diverse stakeholders to identify and address equity issues, building equity considerations into procurement activities, and developing a strategy to collaborate with regional employer partners on equity efforts, as well as reviewing and discussing the [Ready for Equity in Workforce Development Racial Equity Readiness Assessment](#) Tool.

---

[39] Race Forward. (2018). *Ready for equity in workforce development: Racial Equity Readiness Assessment Tool*. California Workforce Development Board. https://cwdb.ca.gov/wp-content/uploads/sites/43/2020/12/Ready-for-Equity-in-Workforce-Development-%E2%80%93-Racial-Equity-Readiness-Assessment-Tool_ACCESSIBLE.pdf

[40] California Workforce Development Board. (n.d.). *High Road Training Partnerships*. https://cwdb.ca.gov/initiatives/high-road-training-partnerships/

2. Integrate an equity lens into the work of the IWIB.

The IWIB does not currently have an established, ongoing process for analyzing or diagnosing the impact of the design and implementation of policies on underserved and marginalized individuals and groups, as well as for identifying and potentially eliminating barriers. The recommendations below will provide a structured, consistent approach necessary to support progress over time.

Recommended State Actions

- **Establish a permanent Equity Committee** of the IWIB to provide oversight and accountability for the IWIB's equity efforts. Equity is not a one-and-done process, and this work needs to be coordinated and have a means of accountability. This committee can also ensure that the IWIB coordinates with other statewide equity efforts. Responsibilities of the committee in its first year should include the following:

  – refining, distributing to committees, and providing training on how to use an equity tool for analyzing policies, programs, and impact through an equity lens (see below):

  – working with IWIB committees to identify opportunities to integrate an equity lens into their work;

  – coordinating with DCEO, IDES, ICCB, and IDHS-DRS on the development and delivery of the Equity Academy;

  – reviewing local area plans, reports, and other equity-related analyses;

  – providing quarterly updates to the IWIB on progress toward equity goals implementation of the ETF recommendations; and

  – coordinating with other statewide equity efforts, including the Commission on Workforce System Equity and Access.

Ensure that equity is a key consideration in the development of new IWIB policies, programs, and budgets by **requiring policy committees to use an equity tool for analyzing policies and programs through an equity lens**.[41] Examples of policies that would benefit from analysis through an equity lens soon include the following:

> ### Our Working Definition of an Equity Lens
>
> An equity lens is "*an ongoing process for analyzing or diagnosing the impact of the design and implementation of policies on under-served and marginalized individuals and groups, and to identify and potentially eliminate barriers.*"
>
> *Source:* Minnesota State Office of Equity and Inclusion

---

[41] Nelson, J., & Brooks, L. (2016). *Racial equity toolkit: An opportunity to operationalize equity*. Local and Regional Government Alliance on Race and Equity. https://racialequityalliance.org/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/GARE-Racial_Equity_Toolkit.pdf

- American Job Center (AJC) procurement and monitoring policies; and

- ETP policy.

- Direct local workforce boards to create report cards around key equity data elements. Direct DCEO to set aside 1 percent of statewide WIOA funds to provide local workforce boards with resources to create these reports and to provide data and technical assistance to support boards in this effort.[42]

- Examine recipients of competitively awarded WIOA funding (including the governor's reserve funding, competitive grants, and AJC competitions) to **understand the extent to which there is currently an equitable investment of funds**. Adopt policies to ensure equitable fund disbursement going forward.

- **Take advantage of WIOA performance policy to focus services on individuals with barriers to employment.**[43] When negotiating goals with U.S. Department of Labor and local areas for the WIOA Adult and Youth programs, base negotiations on realistic data about the expected performance levels for the individuals with significant barriers to employment that IL intends to serve with these programs. Take advantage of the objective statistical adjustment model described in 677.210 of the Joint Final Rule on WIOA.[44] The model decreases performance levels (or targets) at the end of the program year if a state or local area were to serve a higher-than-anticipated percentage of individuals with barriers because those individuals are harder to serve.

Opportunities for Local Areas

Local workforce boards can integrate an equity lens into their work by adopting the IWIB's equity tool (when available) to support their own analyses of policies, programs, and budgets through an equity lens; integrating equity considerations into local and regional plans; setting and working toward equity goals; and enforcing state policies designed to ensure equity in the system.

Local workNet operators and other service providers can integrate an equity lens into their work by adopting the IWIB's equity tool to support their own analysis of policies, programs, and budgets through an equity lens.

---

[42] This effort would be similar in scope that the one currently under way to support service integration.
[43] Center for Law and Social Policy. (2016, September 21). *WIOA performance targets: Incentives to improve workforce services for individuals with barriers to employment*. https://www.clasp.org/publications/fact-sheet/wioa-performance-targets-incentives-improve-workforce-services-individuals/
[44] Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act of 2014. Joint Rule for Unified and Combined State Plans, Performance Accountability, and the One-Stop System Joint Provisions. 20 C.F.R. 677.210. 2016. https://www.ecfr.gov/current/title-20/chapter-V/part-677/subpart-C/section-677.210

3. Invest in data analysis capacity, track disaggregated data and outcomes, and identify disparities and factors contributing to those disparities.

To better understand inequities and take action to address them, capacity, particularly at the state level, should be further developed to collect, disaggregate, and analyze the service provision and outcome data of workers that receive services and training.

Recommended State Actions

- In coordination with the State Office of Equity, **ensure that WIOA agencies have a coordinated approach to analyzing WIOA data through an equity lens**, and that these agencies develop and provide guidance and training to local workforce areas/program operators on how to use WIOA and other key labor market data to measure the success of specific programmatic and policy changes, as well as to develop baselines, set equity goals, and measure progress toward goals. This should be tied to the regional planning process. As part of this process, the board should learn from local workforce agencies (LWAs) about their current approaches to data analysis through an equity lens and encourage local policy committees to set equity goals that reflect the unique needs of their area

- **Direct WIOA agencies to identify and invest funds in data analysis capacity**. This should be accomplished through an agreement with a public university to provide specialized staffing to make use of administrative data in the Illinois Longitudinal Data System and other data sources in support of equity goals.[45] The selected university would provide a mechanism to accomplish the following actions:

  - Make disaggregated data available to all local workforce areas and develop and deliver training to key workforce board and AJC leadership and staff on how to interpret it (see Footnote 38).

  - Create state and regional dashboards that show real-time activities and employment outcomes for select workforce development programs by education level, race, ethnicity, sex/gender, and geography.

  - Tailor data to the audience. For example, develop fact sheets and concise summaries for those who are unlikely to use a data portal, such as policymakers (including legislators, IWIB members, and key agency leaders), businesses (which might benefit from knowing

---

[45] Workforce Equity Metrics (innonet.org). See pp. 9 and 10 for data sources and considerations for data gathering and structure and pp. 14 and 15 for examples of metrics, dashboards, and data analysis systems. Morariu, J., Mridul, A., & Roncaglione, V. (2020, July). *Workforce equity metrics: How workforce systems and organizations are incorporating equity into their metrics*. Innovation Network. https://www.innonet.org/media/InnovationNetwork-Workforce_Equity_Metrics.pdf

Equity Task Force Report

who is accessing the workforce system, how they are benefiting, and how the system can help businesses achieve equity goals), and jobseekers (whose career planning might be informed by this data).

- Pilot the use of the disproportionate impact analysis methodology across all WIOA programs to analyze access and outcomes. The results from an initial application of this approach are included earlier in this report and in Appendix C, Attachment 4: WIOA Title I Data Analysis Methodology and Results.

- Encourage state and regional agencies to **use available data to conduct a formal equity analysis to determine service gaps and develop solutions**. The Evaluation Guidelines developed by the IWIB Continuous Improvement Committee provide guidance on these types of analyses.

- State and regional workforce boards should **regularly convene focus groups with individuals intended to be served by the workforce system** (including WIOA participants, WIOA exiters, and those the system is intended to serve but have not enrolled) to understand constituent feedback, lived experience, and insights. The collection of these additional qualitative data should be coupled with customer survey data from a standardized statewide survey effort. Taken together, these can help confirm, challenge, or deepen the validity of conclusions about quantitative data pertaining to customer needs, decision making, and barriers experienced. In using both quantitative and qualitative data, leaders can better develop and implement policies and practices to equitably meet customer needs.

Opportunities for Local Areas

Local workforce boards can use data to inform their equity strategies by analyzing disaggregated data provided in regional dashboards and reports. They can pair the insights from the data with insights gathered through focus groups and other stakeholder engagement activities to identify disparities and the causes of those disparities, as well as to develop equitable policies, programs, and services.

4. Diversify workforce system leadership and staff and provide systemwide training on equity, cultural competence, and cultural awareness and humility for those served by the system.

Frontline staff at American job centers and other WIOA-funded programs should be representative of the communities that they serve to reduce bias and negative impacts such as occupational segregation. Given their role in deciding which career pathways and key workforce strategies to prioritize, the leadership of workforce boards and American job centers should reflect the communities they serve, which would require including women, people of color, people with disabilities, as well as other worker representation. All workforce system staff should understand the concepts of cultural competence, be aware of where they are in the continuum of cultural competence, and be actively working to move forward along that continuum.

Recommended Actions

- Encourage local workforce areas to make concerted efforts to **recruit, retain, and advance staff that reflect the communities they serve**, including people of color.

- Issue guidance emphasizing the importance of **hiring/nominating workforce system leaders, board members, and staff who reflect the diversity and lived experiences of the populations served by the WIOA system**, and adopt this practice within the IWIB.

> ### Our Understanding of Cultural Competence
>
> *"Cultural competence is defined as a set of values, behaviors, attitudes, and practices within a system, organization, program or among individuals and which enables them to work effectively cross culturally. Further, it refers to the ability to honor and respect the beliefs, language, interpersonal styles and behaviors of individuals and families receiving services, as well as staff who are providing such services. Striving to achieve cultural competence is a dynamic, ongoing, developmental process that requires a long-term commitment."*
>
> –Denboba, Maternal and Child Health Bureau, 1993

- Direct state WIOA agencies to **provide coordinated training for state agency staff** responsible for strategic planning, policy development, procurement, oversight, and other key state WIOA roles on how to apply an equity lens to their work..

- **Increase knowledge and changing attitudes and behaviors through timely, accessible, up-to-date information and training provided through the Professional Development Committee**. Workforce system leaders and staff cannot be motivated or ready to adopt strategies that increase equity in the workforce system if they have not had the opportunity to understand, learn about, and consider the implications of such changes on many levels. These learning opportunities will not be sufficient for adjusting systemic practice, sustaining new skills, and changing organizational and systems supports. The information-sharing and

exploration opportunities necessary to the success of this work, however, cannot be overlooked. While all WIOA state agencies currently provide equity-related professional development, a coordinated approach is critical to achieving desired impact. The IWIB should direct state WIOA agencies to set aside a portion of their TA/professional development funds to go into a state pool to build equity skills for workforce development leaders and staff. Details are provided in the Program Work Group's report, found in Appendix C, Attachment 3. Key topics include understanding and recognizing the following:

- IWIB's vision for equity, and how it fits into broader equity-building efforts in Illinois;

- how current inequities impact Illinois residents;

- diversity, equity, inclusion, and access concepts;

- cultural and linguistic competencies and skills;

- state and regional data, disaggregated by sex, race, ethnicity, and other key characteristics impacting equity;

- evidence-based and promising practices for increasing equity in the workforce system; and

- local workforce areas that achieve equity goals to document and disseminate their approaches.

- Provide capacity building and training for workNet staff **on how to identify implicit bias and remove it from their counseling**, with the goal of helping customers of all sexes/gender identities and races access good jobs with family-sustaining wages and career pathways.[46, 47]

- Provide training to workNet operators on local policies/practices that can negatively impact equity[48] and on alternative **policies and practices that are culturally responsive and account for implicit bias**.

---

[46] This training can also leverage the work of the IWIB committee focused on returning individuals and the Safer Foundation, that AJCs are designed to be welcoming and accessible to all customers, including people of color, those with limited English proficiency, those with disabilities, and those with limited technology access/skills.

[47] For example, barriers identified for eligibility enrollment can be subject to biases and improving on how data are collected related to barriers is a critical component to advancing equity with WIOA funds. For example, are Black women more likely to report that they are low income? Or are they asked at a higher rate than other races of women to increase the likelihood of qualifying for enrollment, or possibly being asked this question based on stereotypes and biases thinking? Are all women asked the same questions to be considered for enrollment, or are shortcuts made based on assumptions? The same can be said for Black men, who are more likely to report they are ex-offenders. Are all men being asked about criminal backgrounds? Is one race of individuals being asked specific questions to make them eligible that could be rooted in bias?

[48] Spaulding, S., & Gebrekristos, S. (2018, March). *Family-centered approaches to workforce program services: Findings from a survey of workforce development boards.* Urban Institute. https://www.urban.org/sites/default/files/publication/97426/family-centered_approaches_to_workforce_program_services_4.pdf

Local workforce boards can review their current staff demographics and implement hiring/nominating processes to ensure that workforce system leaders, board members, and staff reflect the diversity of the populations served in the region. They can build the capacity and skills of frontline staff and leadership by participating in statewide trainings and investing in their own training targeted to regional needs.

5. Provide funding to, and partner with, organizations providing culturally specific services with a track record of success in serving target populations.

To increase access to workforce training and services for women, people of color, and other groups, local workforce agencies should fund and partner with organizations beyond traditional service providers, particularly organizations with a track record of cultural competency and success in serving the populations of concern as identified by the ETF. Furthermore, the ETP approval and evaluation processes should take into consideration their ability to serve key customer populations.

Recommended State Actions

- **Help culturally responsive community-based organizations qualify for the Eligible Training Provider List (ETPL):**
  - Provide proactive training to such organizations offering training to target populations on how to use and navigate the system.
  - Add criteria to the ETP policy about whether training organizations intentionally conduct outreach and provide quality services to target populations, and whether they have community support.
  - Ensure that all training providers are included in the interactive map of training providers.
  - Include in the revised ETPL policy an acknowledgment that the ETPL has equity implications for customer outcomes, and that informing customer choice should include data about how ETPs perform. ETPL policy should also include requirements to evaluate outcomes and ban predatory training providers that have a track record of poor completion and employment outcomes.
  - Examine the equity impact of current criteria for the demand occupations list and ensure that local areas have a simple process for including local in-demand occupations.

Opportunities for Local Areas

Local workforce boards can increase their collaboration with culturally competent organizations by proactively reaching out to organizations that recruit and provide quality services to target populations to inform them about the workforce system and explore opportunities for partnership and coordination. Through customer-centered design, local workforce boards can design services that are easy for customers of multiple programs to access.

6. Prioritize workforce services that include supportive services.

Within the context of keeping the cost per participant served low, the IWIB should find ways to prioritize programming that effectively serves jobseekers, including those offering supportive services.

Recommended Actions

- Direct state agencies to **design funding competitions to include appropriate supportive services**, including follow-up and postemployment support.

- Work with state agencies to **strengthen partnerships** across the workforce development ecosystem to increase access to available supportive services.

- Encourage local workforce boards to include input of impacted groups in decisions about the design and delivery of employment programming and policies guiding local workforce systems and to **adopt a human-centered approach to designing services** (see Footnote 38).

- Communicate opportunities for local workforce areas to **access resources for supportive services**, including the following:

  - computer/tablet purchases for clients;

  - expending program funds for home Internet access as well as partnering with broader municipal Internet accessibility efforts; and

  - digital literacy training as a core component of workforce preparation (this is a good opportunity for alignment with WIOA Title II, Adult Education).

Opportunities for Local Areas

Local workforce boards can help to increase customer access to supportive services by using a human-centered approach to designing services and proactively identifying opportunities to leverage supportive and wraparound services provided by other organizations.

Appendix A. List of Task Force Members

Name	Organization	Email	Workgroup
Lawrence Benito	Coalition of Immigrant and Refugee Rights	lbenito@icirr.org	Data
Nashad Carrington	The Carrington Firm	nashad@carringtonfirm.com	Data
Antoinette Golden	IDES	Antoinette.Golden@Illinois.gov	Data
Jonathan Lanning	Federal Reserve Bank of Chicago	jonathan.lanning@chi.frb.org	Data
Emily Rusca	P-20 Council	erusca@niu.edu	Data
Daniel Sullivan	Federal Reserve Bank of Chicago	daniel.sullivan@chi.frb.org	Data
Stephanie Veck	Maher and Maher	sveck@mahernet.com	Data
Andrew J. Wells	The Chicago Urban League	AWells@chiul.org	Data
Elba Aranda-Suh, Co-Chair	National Latino Education Institute	elbaaranda@nlei.org	Policy
Peter A. Creticos	Institute for Work and the Economy	creticos@workandeconomy.org	Policy
Jamie Ewing	Chinese American Service League (CASL)	jamie_ewing@caslservice.org	Policy
Pastor Ford	Saint Paul Church	kford4526@gmail.com	Policy
Jennifer Foster	ICCB	Jennifer.Foster@illinois.gov	Policy
Jessica Linder-Gallo	Greater Aurora Chamber of Commerce	jlindergallo@aurora-chamber.com	Policy
Laura Gergely	LWIA 1- Equity Task Force	LGergely@lakecountyil.gov	Policy
Greg Harle	Plumbers & Pipefitters LU23	gharle@ualocal23.org	Policy
Jason Keller	Federal Reserve Bank of Chicago	jason.keller@chi.frb.org	Policy
Sergio Mendoza	Quad Cities Hispanic Chamber of Commerce	smendoza@eicc.edu	Policy
Angela Morrison	Chicago Jobs Council	angela@cjc.net	Policy
Magdalena Rivera	Illinois Migrant Council	mrivera@illinoismigrant.org	Policy
Julio Rodriguez	Illinois Department of Commerce	Julio.Rodriguez@illinois.gov	Policy
Manny Rodriguez	Executive Director	Revolution Workshop	Policy

Manika Turnbull	Blue Cross Blue Shield Illinois	Manika_Turnbull@bcbsil.com	Policy
Itedal Shalabi	Arab American Family Services	ishalabi@aafsil.org	Policy
Audra Wilson, Esq.	Shriver Center on Poverty Law	audrawilson@povertylaw.org	Policy
Lisa Bly-Jones, Co-Chair	The Workforce Connection	lbly@theworkforceconnection.org	Program
Diana Alfaro	Office of Minority Economic Empowerment	diana.alfaro@illinois.gov	Program
Bridget Altenburg	National Able Network	baltenburg@nationalable.org	Program
Katherine Blank	Access Living	kblank@accessliving.org	Program
Jeremiah Boyle	Federal Reserve Bank of Chicago	jeremiah.p.boyle@chi.frb.org	Program
Pat Devaney	IL AFL-CIO Union	pdevaney@ilafl-cio.org	Program
Morgan Diamond	Individual	morganadiamond@gmail.com	Program
Adrian Esquivel	Chicagoland Workforce Funder Alliance	aesquivel@cct.org	Program
LaTanya Law	DHS	LaTanya.Law2@Illinois.gov	Program
Emily Garrity	LWIA 1 Equity Task Force Co-Chair ConnectVets	emilygarrity@connectvetsconsulting.com	Program
Delmar L. Gillus, Jr.	Elevate Energy	Delmar.Gillus@elevateenergy.org	Program
Teresa Haley	NAACP Illinois State Conference	thaley@illinoisnaacp.org	Program
Aime'e Julian	Illinois Center for Specialized Professional Support	alafoll@ilstu.edu	Program
Clayton Pryor	Advocate Aurora Health	clayton.pryor@aah.org	Program
Tom Wendorf	Illinois Workforce Innovation Board Business Engagement Committee	twendorf47@gmail.com	Program
Laura Wilhelm	Disability in Chicagoland	Laura@di-chi.org	Program
Stephanie Lipe	Department of Rehabilitative Services	Stephanie.Lipe@illioise.gov	Program

Appendix B. Resources and Tools to Support Equity in the Workforce System

The IWIB Equity Task Force invites the Illinois Workforce Innovation Board, state agencies, workforce system leaders and practitioners, and others interested in this work to explore the resources and tools below, organized by topic.

Equity in Workforce Development

Amuh, D., Bustillo, D., Minson, C., & Shevlin, P. (2021, June 28). *Guest Post: Seven Recommendations to Advance Racial Equity in the Workforce System*. Workforce Matters Funders Network. https://workforce-matters.org/guest-post-seven-recommendations-to-advance-racial-equity-in-the-workforce-system/

Associated Black Charities. (n.d.). *Ten essential questions for workforce development*. https://static1.squarespace.com/static/5728e34fd51cd4809e7aefe0/t/5ef0f0bd16217c2827f10469/1592848573424/10+Essential+Questions+for+Workforce+Development.pdf

Newman, A. (2020, June). *An equity imperative: How the workforce system can advance workforce health and safety during and after the pandemic.* Aspen Institute. https://www.aspeninstitute.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/06/An-Equity-Imperative-How-the-Workforce-System-Can-Advance-Workplace-Health-and-Safety-During-and-After-the-Pandemic-1.pdf

Child Trends (2021, June). *Integrating a Racial and Ethnic Equity Lens into Workforce Development Training for Young Adults*. https://www.childtrends.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/05/GenWorkIndianapolis_Child-Trends_June2021.pdf

Minson, C. (2021, February 19). *The workforce development field or a conduit for maintaining systemic racism?* Federal Reserve Bank of Atlanta. https://doi.org/10.29338/wc2021-01

National Fund for Workforce Solutions. (2020). *Race and the Future of Work*. https://nationalfund.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/11/Race_and_the_Work_of_the_Future_United_States_FINAL.pdf

National Fund for Workforce Solutions. (2021, January). *Advancing Workforce Equity: A Blueprint for Regional Action in Five U.S. Cities*. https://nationalfund.org/advancing-workforce-equity-reports/

National Governors Association. (2021, August). *Creating a More Equitable Workforce System: Opportunities for Governors and*

Appendix C. List of Attachments

Four attachments reflect additional work of the Equity Task Force, including the reports of the three work groups (attachments 1 – 3), which were incorporated into this report, and the WIOA Title I Data Analysis Methodology and Results, which deeply informed all three work groups.

Attachment 1: Data Work Group Report

Attachment 2: Policy Work Group Report

Attachment 3: Program Work Group Report

Attachment 4: WIOA Title I Data Analysis Methodology and Results

Illinois Workforce Investment Board (IWIB) Equity Taskforce Data Workgroup Recommendations:

**Education and workforce tools that can track program access and outcomes and disaggregate data
to reveal disparities in policies and program delivery**

January 24, 2022

The Equity Taskforce Data Workgroup met over the past year to discuss education and workforce tools that can track program access and outcomes and disaggregate data to reveal disparities in policies and program delivery. These discussions included a specific focus on current WIOA data infrastructure; methods to analyze WIOA data through an equity lens; how to interpret results of WIOA data analysis; and detailed analysis of Illinois WIOA Title I data. The workgroup recommends future analysis of WIOA Title II, III, and IV data. This document captures potential recommendations that the workgroup can further discuss and refine. All recommendations are drawn explicitly from workgroup discussions, except for those noted in the footnotes, which were presented to the workgroup in meetings but not discussed in depth.

Key Challenges and Opportunities

The workgroup had ready access to WIOA Title I data disaggregated by sex, race, and ethnicity. The workgroup reviewed issues related to data collection, analysis, and dissemination. It was through that process that it developed the recommendations contained in this document.

Data Lifecycle

The recommendations in this document are organized around the following general data lifecycle. For each element in the lifecycle, the document notes barriers identified by the workgroup, the potential source of those barriers, if known, and potential workgroup recommendations.

	Barrier	Potential Recommendations
Plan | Prepare	WIOA data alone does not provide a complete picture of workforce trends and inequities that limit employment for targeted groups who are seeking entry into the workforce or access to living-wage careers. WIOA does not collect data for all target groups for which the IWIB wants to consider equity. For example, WIOA collects data on sex (male/female), but not gender identity. Data analysis requires time, resources, and skilled staff.	In consultation with local workforce boards, the IWIB should identify a list of key indicators that provides a broader picture of workforce trends an inequities. The Equity Indicators project run by the CUNY Institute for State and Local Governance provides a number of potential indicators to be broken out by sex, race, and ethnicity, as wells as the means of calculating them[1], including: • **Disconnected Youth** – the percent of the population aged 16-24 who are neither working or in school. • **Labor Force Participation** – the percent of the population aged 16 or older who are neither working nor looking for work. A focused look at those ages 25 to 64 may be beneficial here. • **Unemployment** – the percent of the labor force that is unemployed. • **Participation in Workforce Development Programs** – the percent of the unemployed population who did not participate in IL WIOA programs. • **Employment in High Wage Industries** – the percent of employed individuals who are not employed in industries with a mean annual wage of at least $80,000. • **Living Wage** – the hourly wage of all workers ages 16+ compared to statewide or regional living wage. The IWIB should request that WIOA agencies report on the feasibility of collecting data elements that may not be required by WIOA such as history of incarceration, housing status, and LGBTQIA identity. It should also explore collecting data on how employers who use the workforce system are or are not striving for equity, considering what data might demonstrate what employers are doing and can do better to increase equity. The IWIB, in coordination with the State Office of Equity, should ensure that WIOA agencies have a coordinated approach to analyzing WIOA data through an equity lens, and that these agencies develop and provide guidance and training to local workforce areas/program operators on how to use WIOA and other key labor market data to measure the success of specific programmatic and policy changes, and to develop baselines, set equity goals, and measure progress towards goals. This should be tied to the regional planning process. As part of this process, the board should learn from LWAs about their current approaches to data analysis through an equity lens. The IWIB should direct WIOA agencies to invest in data infrastructure, including specialized staffing to design, analyze, and make use of collected data in support of equity goals.[2]

	Barrier	Potential Recommendations
Collect | Process	Case managers may not all have the same understanding of key WIOA data elements and may collect that data differently. There are tensions between providing a customer-centered intake experience and collecting complete data on barriers to employment. Anecdotal reports suggest that some local workforce areas report only the minimum number of barriers necessary to qualify a customer for service, rather than documenting all barriers Quantitative data alone is not sufficient to understand equity in the workforce system.	Ensure that WIOA data is complete and accurate by assessing, and strengthening if necessary, current guidance and training for case managers and other individuals who input data on the definitions of data elements and their relevance to equity work. This may reflect shift in thinking for case managers and the broader workforce system. Collect data on barriers preventing equal access to programs and resources and track relevant outcomes. State and regional workforce boards should regularly convene focus groups with individuals intended to be served by the workforce system (including WIOA participants, WIOA exiters, and those the system is intended to serve but have not enrolled) to understand constituent feedback, lived experience, and insights. The collection of these additional qualitative data should be coupled with customer survey data from a standardized statewide survey effort. Taken together, these can help confirm, challenge, or deepen the validity of conclusions about quantitative data pertaining to customer needs, decision-making, and barriers experienced. In utilizing both quantitative and qualitative data, leaders can better develop and implement policies and practices to equitably meet customer needs.

---

[1] Potential sources of data are identified at Data Exploration | National Fund for Workforce Solutions

[2] Workforce Equity Metrics (innonet.org) – see page 9 and 10 for data sources and considerations for data gathering and structure and pages 14 and 15 for examples of metrics, dashboards, and data analysis systems.

	Barrier	Potential Recommendations
Analyze | Summarize	There is no single recognized analytical model to understand equity/inequity in the workforce system Quantitative data alone is not sufficient to understand the equity implications of WIOA data	Pilot the use of the disproportionate impact analysis methodology across all WIOA programs to analyze access and outcomes. The results from an initial application of this approach are included earlier in this report, and in the appendix. Using qualitative data gathered from workforce system customers, along with quantitative data, state and regional workforce boards should seek to identify root causes of data trends.

	Barrier	Potential Recommendations
Present | Communicate	Workforce development leaders and practitioners do not have a shared understanding of workforce trends and inequities that limit employment for targeted groups who are seeking entry into the workforce or access to living-wage careers. Policy and program development staff at the state and regional level do not have access to disaggregated WIOA data.	Create state and regional dashboards that show real-time activities and employment outcomes for select workforce development programs by education level, race, ethnicity, sex/gender, and geography. Examples of others states who have done this include: • The **Minnesota** Employment and Economic Division launched the Uniform Report Card that does this (select "Report Card" from this page to explore the dashboard). • **Washington** is establishing a system-level dashboard that reflects progress towards family-sustaining wage levels, disaggregated by populations and regions. Dashboard metrics and targets will reflect cost of living differences between and among regions. Because the new targets will require improved service integration to be achieved, administrative agencies and program providers are developing common intake, service planning, and case management tools. • Massachusetts publishes quarterly data for all of its workforce areas. Fiscal Year 2021 CCPR | Mass.gov Illinois might do something like this, and enhance it by breaking down the data by sex, race, and ethnicity. Tailor data to audience. For example, develop fact sheets and concise summaries for those who are unlikely to use a data portal, such as policymakers (including legislators, IWIB members, and key agency leaders) businesses (which might benefit from knowing who is accessing the workforce system, how they are benefiting, and how the system can help businesses achieve equity goals) and jobseekers (whose career planning might be informed by this data). Along with statistics, storytelling is required to provide a deeper context behind the numbers. Build narratives relevant for the legislators and policymakers. At the same time, be careful not to reinforce negative/unhelpful stereotypes. Use data to go beyond painting a picture of negative outcomes, e.g., unemployment, to lift up underlying dynamics such as disinvestment, exclusion, etc.[3]

---

[3] Workforce Equity Metrics (innonet.org)

	Barrier	Potential Recommendations
Implement | Manage	In the absence of goals, the IL workforce system does not have a common equity outcome they are working towards. Regional workforce development leaders and staff may not have training to interpret disaggregated data through an equity lens.	Use data analysis and information gathered in previous steps to set equity goals in consultation with the Office of Equity. Use data on service gaps to set unique goals for access and adoption of essential workforce development and support services across populations.[4] Direct WIOA agencies to identify or develop and provide training to local and regional workforce leadership and staff on how to analyze and interpret data through an equity lens. Encourage state and regional agencies to use available data to conduct a formal equity analysis to determine service gaps and develop solutions. The Evaluation Guidelines developed by the IWIB Continuous Improvement Committee provide guidance on these types of analyses.

---

[4] Creating a More Equitable Workforce System: Opportunities for Governors and States - National Governors Association

Attachment 2: Illinois Workforce Investment Board (IWIB) Equity Taskforce Policy Workgroup Recommendations:

Strategies to Remove Barriers to Equity in Programs, Policies, and Practices

January 24, 2022

The Equity Taskforce Policy Workgroup met over the past year to discuss strategies to remove barriers to equity in programs, policies, and practices. These discussions included a specific focus on the ability of culturally responsive community-based organizations to qualify for the Eligible Training Provider List (ETPL) (see page 5). Workgroup discussions also covered programs, policies, and practices across the full range of services available to workforce system customers, as well as state and regional governance policies and practices. The Equity Taskforce Co-Leads have also raised issues related to governance and leadership that are reflected here. This document captures workgroup recommendations.

Workforce System Customer Flowchart

The recommendations in this document are organized around the following general workforce system customer flowchart. Actual customer experiences at IL American Job Centers (AJCs) vary by AJC and are usually more complex. However, this is offered as a potential general structure for workgroup recommendations. For each element in the flowchart, the document notes barriers identified by the workgroup, the potential source of those barriers, if known, and potential workgroup recommendations.

Workforce System Structure and Governance, which impacts Customer Experience

Outreach/Recruitment	Enrollment	Career Counseling/Job Search	Job Training	Job Placement and Follow Up

Recommended Goals

Based on the recommendations below, the workgroup recommends that the following three items be expressed to the IWIB as goals to be achieved by the end of 2022.

- Review WIOA Core Program data, disaggregated by sex, race, ethnicity, and other factors, through an equity lens every six months.
- Integrate the equity tool into the IWIB policy development process.
- Develop and deliver training to community based organizations on how to access the ETPL.

	Barrier	Source	Potential Recommendations
System Structure and Governance	The voices and experiences of workforce system customers may not be centered in decisions impacting the design quality of workforce system services.	State procurement policies and procurement design State and regional staffing and board membership policies State and regional policy and program development processes	Examine recipients of competitively awarded Workforce Investment and Opportunity Act (WIOA) funding to understand the extent to which there is currently an equitable investment of funds. Adopt policies to ensure equitable fund disbursement going forward. • Governor's set aside funding • Competitive grants • AJC competitions Issue guidance emphasizing the importance of hiring/nominating workforce system leaders, board members, and staff that reflect the diversity of the populations served by the WIOA system and adopt this practice within the IWIB. Recognize governing bodies and AJCs that achieve this goal. Ensure that equity is a key consideration in the development of new IWIB policies, programs, and budgets by requiring policy committees to use an equity tool for analyzing policies and programs through an equity lens. Make disaggregated data available to all local workforce areas, develop and deliver training to key workforce board and AJC leadership and staff on how to interpret it, and encourage policy committees to set equity goals that reflect the unique needs of their area.[1] Create conditions where workforce leaders and staff can acknowledge and challenge their own implicit bias and understand the structural barriers impacting customers.[2] Encourage local workforce boards to include input of impacted groups in decisions about the design and delivery of employment programming and policies guiding local workforce systems and to adopt a human-centered approach to designing services.[3]

Workforce System Customer Flow			
	Barrier	**Source**	**Potential Recommendations**
Outreach and Recruitment	The IL WIOA-funded workforce system serves a small fraction of the populations in need of its services, making outreach to target populations critical. Transition to virtual services has reduced the number of people walking into AJCs, increasing the importance of intentional recruitment strategies for target populations. WIOA performance metrics incentivize providers to serve job seekers with better employment prospects and facing the fewest barriers to success, making it difficult for those with the greatest need for workforce programs to access them.		Provide training to local workforce areas on effective outreach and recruitment strategies. This should include strategies that are linguistically and culturally relevant, are inclusive of all gender identities and disability statuses, and that consider language and technology access. Recognize local workforce areas that are effective in reaching out to and recruiting target populations. Take advantage of WIOA performance policy to focus services on individuals with barriers to employment[4]: • When negotiating goals with USDOL and local areas for the WIOA Adult and Youth programs, base negotiations on realistic data about the expected performance levels for the individuals with significant barriers to employment that IL intends to serve with these programs. • Take advantage of the objective statistical adjustment model described in 677.210 of the Joint Final Rule on WIOA. The model decreases performance levels (or targets) at the end of the program year if a State or local area were to serve a higher-than-anticipated percentage of individuals with barriers, because those individuals are harder to serve.

---

[4] Source: WIOA Performance Targets: Incentives to Improve Workforce Services for Individuals with Barriers to Employment | CLASP

	Barrier	Source	Potential Recommendations
Enrollment	AJC policies and practices may create unnecessary barriers to program access.	Local policy and practice	Provide training to AJCS on local policies/practices that can negatively impact equity such as:[5] • Prohibiting children at American Job Centers • Hours of operation; accessibility; location • Instituting restrictive program eligibility criteria and intake processes (including choice of assessments) • Under-resourcing supportive services Also provide training on policies and practices that are culturally responsive and account for implicit bias. Create customer-centered design training (also known as human-centered design training) for local AJCs to empower AJC staff to build equitable service delivery strategies.[6] Update AJC procurement and monitoring policies to encourage identification and removal of local barriers to equity.

---

[5] Source: Family-Centered Approaches to Workforce Program Services (urban.org)

[6] Source: TRAINING AND EMPLOYMENT GUIDANCE LETTER No. 07-20, Employment & Training Administration (ETA) - U.S. Department of Labor (doleta.gov)

| Career Counseling and Job Search | Occupational training choice is highly correlated to race and sex/gender in the IL workforce system. Some traditional occupations may lead to poor outcomes.

Digital tools and internet access are vital job search and career advancement resources, yet it is difficult for AJCs to cover these costs.[7]

White women appear to access self-service and staff-assisted services at a higher rate than other WIOA Title I participants. | AJC staff | Provide capacity building and training for AJC staff on how to identify implicit bias and remove it from their counseling, with the goal of helping customers of all sexes/gender identities and races access good jobs with family sustaining wages and career pathways. This training can also leverage the work of the IWIB committee focused on returning individuals and the Safer Foundation. that AJCs are designed to be welcoming and accessible to all customers, including people of color, those with limited English proficiency, those with disabilities, and those with limited technology access/skills.

Communicate opportunities for local workforce areas to access resources for key activities, including:
• Computer/tablet purchases for clients.
• Expending program funds for home internet access as well as partnering with broader municipal internet accessibility efforts.
• Digital literacy training as a core component of workforce preparation (this is a good opportunity for alignment with WIOA Title II, adult education). |

---

[7] Barrier identified in ETF member Bridget Altenburg in September presentation ABLE

	Barrier	Source	Potential Recommendations
Job Training	Culturally responsive community-based organizations have trouble qualifying for the ETPL. Which organizations are on the ETPL has equity implications. Some training institutions on the ETPL provide career promises but poor completion and employment outcomes.[8]	IWIB ETPL policy	Help culturally responsive community-based organizations qualifying for the Eligible Training Provider List (ETPL): • Provide proactive training to such organizations on how to use and navigate the system. • Add criteria to the ETPL policy about whether training organizations are mission driven, and whether they have community support. • Ensure that all training providers are included in the interactive map. Include in the revised ETPL policy an acknowledgement that the ETP has equity implications and that it should be used to inform customer decisions and allow customers to see data about how ETPL organizations perform. requirements to evaluate outcomes and ban predatory training providers that have a track record of poor completion and employment outcomes. Examine the equity impacts of current criteria for the demand occupations list and ensure that local areas have a non-burdensome process for including local in-demand occupations.

---

[8] Barrier identified in ETF member Bridget Altenburg in September presentation

Equity Task Force Report Attachment

Job Placement and Follow-Up	The quality of available jobs can vary considerably by region and occupation.		Encourage public workforce system leaders to support employers with tools to advance equity. This could include
			• Educating employer partners about training in equity and quality jobs
			• Encourage approaches that "prepare jobs for people" in addition to "preparing people for jobs," and support employer partners in doing the same.[9]
			• Prioritize partnerships with business that demonstrate a commitment to equity through practices such as:
			  ◦ Providing equity training to managers and staff
			  ◦ Developing and implementing practices that will increase sustainable placement for women, workers of color, and workers with disabilities, such as new-hire cohorts and culturally competent management strategies.
			Funding must be set aside for follow-up and support - post-employment support. Retention and follow-up services.
			case management/follow-up services.

---

[9] Source: Five Things Public Workforce Systems Should Do Now to Advance Racial Equity | Heartland Alliance

Attachment 3: Illinois Workforce Investment Board (IWIB) Equity Taskforce Program Workgroup Recommendations:

**Inclusive and diverse approaches to organizational capacity and professional development
to ensure use of an equity lens in serving diverse populations**
January 24, 2022

The Equity Taskforce Program Workgroup met over the past year to discuss strategies to ensure use of an equity lens in serving diverse populations through inclusive and diverse approaches to organizational capacity in the IL workforce investment system. These discussions included a specific focus on professional development, as well as broader discussions of capacity building and technical assistance. The workgroup also heard from staff of the Colorado and California workforce boards about their approaches to capacity building and technical assistance to advance their state equity agendas. This document captures workgroup recommendations.

The recommendations in this document are organized into two categories:
- Providing timely, high quality, useful, and accessible information about equity in the workforce system via training and professional development
- Investing in capacity building and technical assistance

Recommended Goals
Based on the recommendations below, the workgroup recommends that the following three items be expressed to the IWIB as goals to be achieved by the end of 2022.
- Deliver a 3-part WIOA Wednesday series on equity
- Adapt and distribute an equity assessment tool for local boards and AJCs
- Identify funding and staffing for and design cohort-based technical assistance to begin in January, 2023

The Role of Training and Professional Development in Implementing the IWIB's Equity Vision

To successfully achieve the IWIB's vision for equity in the workforce system, the Program Workgroup recommends that the IWIB act to increase the capacity of the system to make change at every level. To help staff and leaders of the system adopt an equity lens, the IWIB should offer workforce development professionals the opportunity to examine their underlying beliefs and attitudes about race, ethnicity, gender, cultural sensitivity and other topics, adapt those beliefs and attitudes if necessary, and encourage inquiry, as well as offer opportunities for reflection, deep conversations, and promising practice sharing within and across organizations. Ultimately, the IWIB will need to impact the mindset of state and local board members, agency leadership and staff, and local leadership and staff. For many organizations, a culture shift may be needed. Training, professional development, and capacity building have a role to play in supporting these changes, alongside the policy, program, and data recommendations described elsewhere in this report.

The Program Workgroup recommends that the IWIB undertake two types of activities:
- Providing timely, high quality, useful, and accessible information about equity in the workforce development system and provide diversity, equity and inclusion professional development and training at all levels. These trainings should provide space and a platform for dialogue and reflection, be transformational, delivered by experts, and cover all equity issues in the state; and
- Fostering cross-organizational collaboration to develop an Equity Lens for all workforce system services and transactions.

1. **Increasing knowledge and changing attitudes through timely, accessible, up to date information and training**. Workforce system leaders and staff cannot be motivated or ready to adopt strategies that increase equity in the workforce system if they have not had the opportunity to understand, learn about, and consider the implications of such changes on many levels. These learning opportunities will not be sufficient for systemic practice change, sustaining new skills, and changing organizational and systems supports. However, the information sharing and exploration opportunities are necessary to the success of this work cannot be overlooked. Key topics include:
    - Understanding the IWIB's vision for equity, and how it fits into broader equity-building efforts in Illinois
    - Understanding how current inequities impact Illinois residents
    - Diversity, Equity, Inclusion, and Access concepts
    - Cultural and Linguistic Competencies and skills
    - Understanding state and regional data, disaggregated by sex, race, ethnicity, and other key characteristics impacting equity
    - Evidence-based and promising practices for increasing equity in the workforce system
    - Recognizing local workforce areas that achieve equity goals and documenting and disseminating their approaches

The IWIB Professional Development Committee offers a range of training and professional development vehicles the IWIB can use to deliver information and training on these topics. We recommend that the IWIWB present these recommendations the WIOA Professional Development Committee, and that the PDC prioritize these topics as they plan their FY23 calendar. While we recognize that these recommendations are beyond the scope of what the PDC has done in the last few years, the urgency and importance of this work demand robust and widely delivered training.

 More information and detailed recommendations are included in Appendix X.

2. **Building capacity through technical assistance.** Technical Assistance (TA) supports help systems and organizations attain broad goals and address complex issues. It can take the form of training, coaching, educating, problem-solving, and otherwise supporting relevant stakeholders. TA can help ensure that organizations and systems that interact with individual practitioners (e.g., funding, time, policies) are addressed and that systems are developed to improve, sustain, and regenerate the competencies of case managers and other front-line staff. Potential TA strategies could include:
    a. **Developing and disseminating an equity assessment tool.** The Ready for Equity in Workforce Development Racial Equity Readiness Assessment Tool developed by Race Forward and the Center for Social Inclusion is one example of tool that could be used or modified to help workforce development organizations and practitioners to evaluate their programs, operations, and culture in order to identify strength areas and growth opportunities. Practitioners can use this toolkit to familiarize themselves with various practices and policies that support institutional racial equity, evaluate their current efforts, and plan action steps.
    b. **Providing cohort-based learning opportunities** in which local workforce areas analyze their disaggregated data, listen to their customers, identify potential changes to their programs and service delivery models, and implement those changes. Peer-to-peer learning like this can significantly enhance capacity in the state.
    c. **Coaching regional workforce areas on how to develop regional plans that center equity**. The Equity Tool piloted by the Policy Workgroup could be used to guide such coaching.
    d. **Create a Community of Practice and Accountability for stakeholders** to set in motion plans for addressing inequity in their organizations and in the people they serve. Modeled after a similar activity lead by the Colorado Workforce Development Council, this community of practice could offer a flexible opportunity for stakeholder organizations to reflect on the journey of their equity work, honor where their organization is on that journey, and provided support for organizations to take the next step. This would help the IWIB identify equity-minded workforce development organizations in the state and support and lift up their work.

e. **Providing competitive grants** to organizations that pilot and (when ready) take to scale service delivery models that advance equity. This is the approach California is taking with its High Road Training Partnerships.

Appendix X. Training and Professional Development Topics and Strategies

In 2022, the IWIB will offer three types of training and professional development (PD) for state and local workforce system staff. Each of these training types is offered in a different format and targets different audiences.

PD Type	Format	Audience
WIOA Wednesday Webinars	Webinars with handouts	All IL workforce development professionals
The WIOA Summit	Hybrid format on April 28 - 29, 2022	Required participants: IWIB/LWIB Business Members; Local Workforce Innovation Board Chairs and other LWIB Staff; WIOA One-Stop Operator; WIOA Core Program Administrators/other Department Designated Staff; Department of Human Services TANF/SNAP E&T Managers Designated Staff; Regional and/or local economic development organizations leaders, including Department of Commerce TeamRED members; Career and Technical Education Administrators Plus a wide range of encouraged participants – note that the workgroup recommends including OMEE (Office of Minority Economic Empowerment)
The Illinois Workforce Academy	On-line Learning Management System (LMS)	Frontline workforce development professionals?

The IWIB can draw on several resources to help develop and deliver these trainings. Specific organizations and resources are listed below.

System-Wide Professional Development Offerings

- The International Association of Workforce Professions offers Curated DEI Resources - IAWP (iawponline.org) (membership required)
- DEI Virtual Academy provided by the National Association DWP: Microsoft Word - DEI Virtual Academy Agenda[6].docx (ymaws.com)
- Workforce180 Racial Equity Certification – Workforce180
- Intercultural development inventory (paid assessment tool) that lets folks know where they sit on cross-cultural work.
- Frontline Focus Training Institute at CJC.

Promising Practices for Organizations

- Pathways to Results (PTR) by the Illinois Office of Community College Research and Leadership (OCCRL) is an outcomes-focused, equity-guided method that can be applied to any program and process that seeks to improve outcomes, programs and policies that support student transition to and through postsecondary education into employment. PTR enables users with methods, templates, and tools to continuously enhance pathways and programs of study by addressing inequities in student outcomes.
- Program Improvement Process for Equity by the National Alliance for Partnerships in Equity (NAPE) is a comprehensive, practical, research-based process for program improvement focused on equity and closing achievement gaps.

WIOA Wednesday Webinars (weekly topics that reach a broad workforce development audience in IL)

Topic	Audience	Primary Learning Objectives	Desired impact
Workforce System Equity 101	State and regional leaders, AJC operators, frontline staff and others working directly with underserved groups	• Introduce state and local leaders and staff to key concepts of equity in the workforce system, including key terms, how equity and inequity impacts workforce system customers, the community, and the Illinois economy, and the role workforce development professionals can play in increasing equity in the system	• Deepen knowledge of equity principles and practices. • Engage in ongoing dialogue and inquiry. • Increase their capacity to engage in reflection and action transform inequitable practices in the workforce system.
Being Intentional about Equity & Inclusion https://youtu.be/Oqna8qfERuI	Workforce Professionals	• Bring awareness to how ones thoughts, feelings, and actions impact the populations served. • Provoke thoughtful introspection about program designs and policies that are developed with unintentional consequences to those we want to serve.	• Invite participants to reflect on their own beliefs, attitudes, and practices.

	AJC operators, frontline staff and others working directly with underserved groups	• Target spending where it is needed the most and make sure that financial resources reach the frontline service delivery facilities where services are actually provided to the people; • Improve capacity and coordination among public stakeholders at different levels of government to increase efficiency, equity, and sustainability of public service provision; • Ensure that frontline service providers are responsive and accountable to the communities they serve; • Monitor and motivate public workers to ensure that they achieve results; and • Create alliances between the public and private sectors and involve providers outside the public sector to unlock the creativity and competitive advantage of the private sector and civil society.	Focuses attention on the effectiveness and equity with which public sector resources and program assistance are being transformed into service delivery
Service Delivery Strategies that Promote Equity			
Customer-Centered Design as an Equity Tool	Frontline staff and others working directly with underserved groups	• Review Customer Centered Design Basics in the context of equity	Designing services that improve the customer experience
Resources to Support Equitable Service Delivery https://www.oregon.gov/DHS/SENIORS-DISABILITIES/SUA/AAABusinessTraining/Service%20Eq	Workforce Service providers	• Providing equitable service to means customizing the delivery of service to each individual served. • Developing new way of working that puts achieving equity front and center and identifies some of the specific actions needed to build a strong and supportive framework for equity	Strengthening relationships with community partners and advocates allows Workforce service providers to see and access our diverse populations through their lens. True

			partnership with our local communities means listening to the client voice with humility and respect while integrating it into agency decisions.
uity%20presented%20April%202014.pdf			

WIOA Summit (statewide hybrid summit)

Topic	Audience	Primary Learning Objectives	Desired impact
Equity in the IL Workforce Investment System	Workforce Professionals at all levels	• Understand statewide efforts to increase equity within the IL workforce development ecosystem and understand how to learn more and play a role in this important work.	Build understanding of and buy-in for the IWIB's vision
The role of local workforce boards in advancing equity	Local/regional workforce board members and staff	• Understand how policies and practices across the workforce customer user journey impact equity • Understand the specific ways local boards can work to increase equity in the workforce system	Encourage boards to take action
Using Customer Centered Design to Improve the Customer's Experience Using-Customer-Centered-Design-to-Improve-the-Customers-min.pdf (ilworkforceacademy.com)	Workforce Professionals	• How to build a customer journey map for your customers, how to identify and solve "pain points", and how to learn from your customer's view of how to build a better program.	A key skill that helps us to create successful relationships with our customers is being able to look at our systems from the perspective of our customers, understanding someone else's viewpoint, we find what they need and want from us, how they are doing with our services, and as a result, how we

			can build a better experience.
Metrics, Accountability, and Transparency: Using WIOA data to set goals and increase equity. https://www.umass.edu/employmentequity/metrics-accountability-and-transparency-simple-recipe-increase-diversity-and-reduce-bias#overlay-context=collecting-lgbt-data-diversity-initiating-self-id		• In order to change behavior, local boards and AJCS must develop appropriate goals and metrics, share them with stakeholders and embrace accountability for outcomes. In the case of diversity, this means boards and AJCs must review disaggregated data, analyze that data, and work towards goals.	Equip local boards and AJCs to use data to inform equity work.
Building a more Inclusive Talent Marketplace https://www.uschamberfoundation.org/topics/workforce-training	Training providers	Fostering closer working relationships between employers and organizations serving communities that have historically faced obstacles entering the workforce, including people of color. breaks down how various workforce stakeholders can use resources and technology — including Chamber tools, such as those created for its T3 Innovation Network and Job Data Exchange — to help unemployed and under-employed people more easily find job opportunities and communicate their experiences and qualifications to employers.	Webinar videos and supporting materials, suggested resources from faculty members, information and study guides for advanced professional certifications, industry reports on current trends, webinars on organization well-being, and much more. The purpose of this resource center is to enhance the Institute learning experience while not on-site.
Advancing Racial Equity in Workforce Development - A model for growing the	Workforce Professionals	The Twin Cities Benchmarking Initiative involved 20 workforce development organizations, three years, two primary funders, and one intermediary	Assessments point to stronger learning cultures that more deeply value and

capacity of workforce intermediaries to address racial equity https://nationalequityatlas.org/sites/default/files/Advancing%20Workforce%20Equity%20in%20Chicago_FINAL.pdf Policy Link https://www.policylink.org/research/advancing-workforce-equity		organization. Its activities included a program outcomes data survey "benchmarking" organizations' program outcomes against national averages, peer learning events, and individualized technical assistance. The initiative generated improvements in specific performance measures or short-term process milestones that each organization deemed core to their mission and priorities.	operationalize the use of data for improvement. Staff are equipped to better analyze their own data, spotlight key process inefficiencies, and sharpen strategies that work.
Reimagining Employer Engagement https://www.reimagineretailchicago.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/07/Reimagining-Employer-Engagement-A-Toolkit-for-Providers-1.pdf	Workforce Professionals and employers	*The Reimagining Employer Engagement* toolkit was published by Reimagine Retail Chicagoland in 2019 and was designed to equip frontline staff with practical tools and information for approaching employers from a strengths-based perspective.	The Toolkit to provides practical information and tools to approach employers from a position of value and help employer partners recruit and retain a high-quality workforce. Working collaboratively with employers can help them create better jobs, increase employee motivation and productivity, and enhance the quality of work life for employees (and their managers too). Also, to

			strengthen the capacity of your organization.

Illinois Workforce Academy (online LMS to provide diverse professional development that advances foundational knowledge for all partners to help WIOA personnel have the knowledge, skills and capacity to effectively serve our customers.)

Topic	Audience	Primary Learning Objectives	Desired impact
Understanding the mindset of DEI cture/leading-diverse-teams-and-organizations/a-growth-mindset-on-dei-tKIUX	Workforce Professionals	In this new course, you'll gain evidence-based knowledge and practical tools to help you design and lead diverse, equitable, and inclusive (DEI) teams and organizations. Whatever your background, and wherever in the world you may be, you'll gain tools to accelerate your personal journey to lead diverse teams and organizations.	Gain tools for the implementation of DEI strategies in organizations, including the architecture of DEI groups, the role of data and metrics, and tools to integrate DEI into the very heart of an organization.
Understanding Cultural and Linguistic Competency			

	Workforce Professionals	Having difficult discussions about the instances of racism that you've seen or felt or even may have even been complicit in. These conversations are essential to affect change, but they're hard and uncomfortable, and you're bound to run into what's known as microaggressions.	Define Microaggressions and their impact on perpetuating discrimination and systemic injustices towards people of color and other outgroups.
Microaggressions Are A Big Deal: How To Talk Them Out And When To Walk Away https://www.npr.org/2020/06/08/872371063/microaggressions-are-a-big-deal-how-to-talk-them-out-and-when-to-walk-away			
Workers' Rights Curriculum https://gallery.mailchimp.com/162199668cd236fc561d582b7/files/b3072cf5-8cd0-4d1f-a487-c10fb7318d00/Workers_Rights_in_Workforce_Development_Report.pdf Request the curriculum developed by Alison Dickson of the School of Labor and Employment Relations at the University of Illinois. https://docs.google.com/forms/d/e/1FAIpQLScvXdE2Z8Q-CEE7FByv4vTyXsk9bM6eQIR-_b5jYSlJ04V45g/viewform	Workforce Professionals	Are you ever unsure of your job seekers' rights in the workplace? Are there times you think your clients are being taken advantage of or discriminated against but are not sure what to do? Knowledge about basic worker protections is a crucial component of any job-readiness program. To answer these questions, CJC presents the Workers' Rights Curriculum developed by Alison Dickson of the School of Labor and Employment Relations at the University of Illinois.	This report recommends two specific strategies workforce development agencies can employ to help promote good job quality standards: 1. Education of the low-wage participants they serve on their fundamental rights on the job and how to protect themselves from abuses such as wage theft. 2. Establishment of metrics for "rating" their employer partners on job quality standards.

Attachment 4: Equity Task Force Data Analysis Methodology and Reports

Prepared by the Equity Task Force Data Workgroup

March, 2022

The ETF Data Workgroup identified *Disproportionate Impact Analysis* (DIA) as a data analysis approach to examine how outcomes vary between target populations. Selected outcomes based on this analysis are presented in the body of the main report. More detailed outcomes for WIOA Title I Adult, Dislocated Worker, and Youth participants are presented in this attachment. In addition to the DIA, the Data Workgroup discussed other potential research questions. The most important of those questions are presented below, follow by the DIA outcomes.

Questions about the information and analysis presented in this document should be directed to the individuals below.

Brian Richard, PhD
Assistant Director, Workforce Development
Center for Governmental Studies
Northern Illinois University
brichard@niu.edu

Yolanda Clark. PhD
Senior Research Associate
Center for Governmental Studies
Northern Illinois University
yclark@niu.edu

Future Research Questions

The Data Workgroup identified research questions that are important but weren't able to be addressed in the limited time that the Task Force was active. The Data Work Group recommends that these be addressed to provide further understanding of equity issues in the WIOA system.

1. Access to good jobs and career pathways
   - What occupations/industries are customers training in?
   - Are customers that train in lower-paying occupations continuing their training/education to move up a career pathway?
   - How do these outcomes differ by demographic characteristics?
2. Access to AJCs and training providers
   - Are training providers located in areas where training is needed?
   - Do some training providers have better outcomes than others?
   - Are the training programs with the best outcomes accessed equitably by race and sex?
   - Does geography (distance from providers) impact the likelihood of accessing training?
   - Are AJCs located in accessible areas?

3. Data quality
   - What are the mechanisms for collecting WIOa participant data?
   - Are data collection methods fully capturing all characteristics of interest about participants?

Disproportionate Impact Analysis

The IWIB Equity Task Force identified fourteen target populations based on Governor Pritzker's Executive Order 2019-03, the U.S. Department of Labor Training and Employment Guidance Letter No 7-20: *Effective Implementation of Priority of Service Provisions for Most in Need Individuals in the Workforce Innovation and Opportunity Act (WIOA) Adult Program*.

The ETF Data Workgroup identified *Disproportionate Impact Analysis* as a data analysis approach to examine how outcomes vary between target populations. As a part of the disproportionate impact discussion, Sosa (2017) describes how differences in performance outcomes "between subgroups may suggest that one group has less access to support services, is in need of relatively greater support, and/or must address certain obstacles in order to attain those outcomes at rates comparable to their peers" (p.3). There are three primary methods used to identify equity gaps and calculate the level of disproportionate impact: 1) 80% Rule Index; 2) Proportionality Index; and 3) Percentage Point Gap Index. These methods can be used as a benchmark and help answer the question, "Is the participant's journey through the Illinois workforce system equitable?" The workgroup focused on the 80% rule index as the method for this analysis.

The 80% Rule Index

Disproportionate Impact (DI) is evident if the performance outcome rate of any subgroup is less than 80% of the group with the highest outcome rate (Guidelines for Measuring Disproportionate Impact in Equity Plans). Utilization of the 80% rule index begins with identifying the subgroup with the highest rate

of success, referred to as the "reference" group. The next step is to divide the success rate of each subgroup (cohort group rate) by that of the reference group: **80% Index = Cohort Group Rate/ Reference Group Rate** (Sosa, 2017). In the tables presented in this appendix, the reference group for each outcome is highlighted in green. Outcomes for groups indicated as disproportionally impacted are highlighted in red.

Data related to seven of the target populations are available in the PY 2019 Participant Individual Record Layout (PIRLs) data and were used to calculate disproportionate impact (DI) levels for pre-enrollment and after-exit quarterly wages for WIOA Title I program participants. The data include participants that exited WIOA Title I Adult, Dislocated Worker, and Youth programs between 1/1/2018 and 3/30/2020.

The tables in this Appendix represent a demonstration of disproportionate impact analysis using WIOA title I program data. This analysis can be extended to other workforce development programs to give a more complete understanding of inequities that may exist within the Illinois workforce development system.

Title I Adult Participants Pre-enrollment characteristics

- Black and Hispanic participants have lower education levels at entry than other groups

- Females have higher attainment rates than males

- Asians are more likely to have a bachelors degree or higher

Table E1. Title I Adult Participants Pre-enrollment characteristics

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	ADULT Educational Attainment at Enrollment							
Participants	1,788	2,473	574	206	1,303	1,792	602	160
HS Equiv or less	48.7%	65.2%	65.9%	55.8%	65.0%	73.8%	76.4%	50.6%
Assoc/Some College	42.6%	25.5%	28.2%	23.8%	20.8%	18.8%	17.8%	16.9%
Bachelors or higher	8.7%	9.3%	5.9%	20.4%	14.2%	7.4%	5.8%	32.5%

- For Adult participants, higher educational attainment is not reflected in pre-enrollment earnings

- Hispanics tend to have higher wages 3 quarters prior to enrollment

- For most race/ethnicity groups, males tend to have higher pre-enrollment earnings

- However, for Black participants females had higher pre-enrollment earnings

- There is not a strong relationship between average income and identification as low income. Black females had higher pre-enrollment earnings than most other groups yet were the most likely to qualify as low income. Asian females were the least likely to qualify as low income yet had the lowest pre-enrollment earnings. Differences in household size (number of earners) may be an explanation

Table E2. Title I Adult Participants Pre-enrollment earnings

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	ADULT Average Quarterly Wage 3 Quarters Prior to Enrollment							
HS Equiv or less	$2,830	$3,133	$3,294	$2,577	$3,033	$2,531	$3,538	$3,355
Assoc/Some College	$3,131	$3,413	$3,263	$2,377	$3,241	$2,728	$3,794	$2,568
Bach or higher	$3,738	$4,095	$4,300	$2,463	$3,960	$3,982	$2,867	$2,300
All Exiters	$3,037	$3,294	$3,345	$2,506	$3,208	$2,676	$3,544	$2,879
Low Income	85.0%	90.6%	80.6%	57.8%	74.0%	81.7%	69.7%	65.1%

Title I Adult Participants Services Accessed

A variety of service levels are available to Title I Adult participants. Self-services include information on state and local labor market conditions; industries, occupations and characteristics of the workforce; area business identified skills needs; employer wage and benefit trends; short- and long-term industry and occupational projections; worker supply and demand; and job vacancies survey results. Workforce information also includes local employment dynamics information such as workforce availability; business turnover rates; job creation; and job identification of high growth and high demand industries. The vast majority of participants that accessed self-services also received staff-assisted services and/or training services.

Staff-assisted services (labeled Staff Services) include career guidance, workforce information, and job search assistance. Career guidance services include the provision of information (Including information on local performance and eligible training providers), materials, suggestions, or advice intended to assist the job seeker in making occupation or career decisions. Workforce information services include information on state and local labor market conditions that included significant staff involvement; industries, occupations and characteristic of the workforce; area business identified skills needs;

employer wage and benefit trends; short- and long-term industry and occupational projections; worker supply and demand; and job vacancies survey results. Workforce information also includes local employment dynamics information such as workforce availability; business turnover rates; job creation; and job identification of high growth and high demand industries. Finally, job search activities with significant staff involvement are designed to help the participant plan and carry out a successful job-hunting strategy. The services include resume preparation assistance, job search workshops, job finding clubs, and development of a job search plan.

- White females are significantly more likely to receive all types of services relative to other groups.

- Asian females are significantly less likely to enter training

- Males are generally more likely to successfully complete training

Table E3. Title I Adult Participants Services Accessed

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	ADULT Percentage of Participants							
Self-Services	43.2%	33.0%	27.9%	23.4%	33.2%	27.9%	21.9%	24.0%
Staff Services	64.5%	45.3%	47.1%	47.7%	54.0%	44.2%	46.2%	52.0%
Rec'd Training	85.0%	70.1%	74.8%	51.4%	79.8%	74.1%	80.1%	68.6%
Tng Completed	77.7%	76.7%	77.1%	81.3%	81.1%	79.3%	82.8%	94.2%

- Participants that received staff assisted career or training services tended to have higher post-exit earnings

- Those that received training had higher post-exit earnings than those that did not

- Training completion was strongly associated with higher earnings

- There were no disproportionate impacts for post-exit earnings for groups that entered and completed training

Table E4. Title I Adult Participants Post-Exit Earnings by Services Accessed

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	ADULT Average Quarterly Wage 2 Quarters After Exit							

	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
All Adult	$7,352	$6,367	$6,540	$6,687	$6,842	$6,232	$7,066	$7,137
Self Services	$7,712	$6,767	$7,317	$6,129	$7,123	$5,603	$6,941	$7,283
Staff Services	$8,001	$6,608	$7,469	$7,319	$6,953	$6,097	$7,220	$7,917
Rec'd Training	$7,895	$7,043	$7,090	$7,512	$7,022	$6,705	$7,095	$7,608
Tng Completed	$8,939	$7,961	$7,976	$8,332	$7,658	$7,398	$7,426	$7,737
Tng Not Compl	$4,264	$4,022	$4,114	$3,961	$4,301	$4,047	$5,500	
No Training	$4,272	$4,779	$4,910	$5,814	$6,131	$4,876	$6,952	$6,109

Title I Adult Participants with a High School Degree or Less

White female participants are more likely than other groups to have educational attainment beyond high school (see Table E1 above). This may be an explanation for their greater propensity to access services (Table E3) and for their higher earnings outcomes (Table E4). Thus, service access and earnings outcomes were recalculated using only exiters that had an educational attainment of a high school (HS) degree or less.

- Among this group of exiters, white females continue to receive services at higher levels than other groups.
- White males are the most likely to received training, with white females receiving training at nearly the same rate.
- Asian exiters are indicated as disproportionately impacted in terms of receiving training services.
- Similar to all exiters, male exiters with a HS degree or less that enter training are more likely than female exiters to successfully complete that training.
- White and Hispanic females are indicated as disproportionately impacted relative to Asian males. However, it should be noted that Asian males represent a small portion of Title I Adult participants with a HS degree or less – about 1.5%.

Table E5. Title I Adult Participants with a HS degree or less Services Accessed

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	ADULT Percentage of Participants							
Self Services	38.2%	28.1%	25.0%	21.5%	31.7%	26.6%	20.8%	16.9%
Staff Services	57.0%	43.6%	44.1%	52.1%	53.3%	43.9%	44.8%	52.8%
Rec'd Training	83.1%	68.9%	76.0%	49.6%	83.3%	75.3%	81.4%	58.4%
Tng Completed	74.7%	76.0%	75.2%	80.0%	79.1%	78.2%	82.1%	94.2%

- When looking at just the group of exiters with an educational attainment of HS degree or less, the benefits of training are still significant.

- Participants that received staff assisted career or training services tended to have higher post-exit earnings

- Training completion was strongly associated with higher earnings

- While for all exiters white females received all types of services had the highest average earnings, for those with HS degrees or less the groups with the highest earnings outcomes varies.

- There were no disproportionate impacts for post-exit earnings for groups that entered training.

- Asian males were indicated as disproportionately impacted in terms of average wages for training completers.

Table E6. Title I Adult Participants with a HS degree or less Post-exit Earnings by Services Accessed

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	ADULT Average Quarterly Wage 2 Quarters After Exit							
All Adult	$5,999	$5,738	$5,875	$6,636	$6,393	$6,143	$6,888	$6,023
Self Services	$6,238	$5,934	$6,548	$5,758	$6,894	$5,485	$6,178	$5,226
Staff Services	$6,241	$5,892	$6,431	$6,911	$6,661	$5,827	$7,022	$7,307
Rec'd Training	$6,450	$6,369	$6,310	$7,392	$6,582	$6,527	$7,036	$6,443
Tng Completed	$7,378	$7,180	$7,010	$8,179	$7,214	$7,287	$7,520	$6,499
Tng Not Compl	$3,705	$3,798	$4,192	$4,245	$4,195	$3,795	$4,820	
No Training	$3,781	$4,338	$4,499	$5,892	$5,448	$4,972	$6,240	$5,432

Title I Adult Participants Credentials Earned

- Asians that entered training were more likely to earn a credential

- White females we significantly more likely to earn an AA/AS or BA/BS degree

- Males were less likely than females to earn an AA/AS or BA/BS degree but more likely to earn an Occupational License or Certificate

Table E7. Title I Adult Participants Credentials Earned

	Female	Male

	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	ADULT Type of Recognized Credential							
Earned Any Credential	71.9%	67.%	66.3%	73.%	69.%	69.%	69.5%	82.%
AA or AS Diploma/Degree	15.1%	4.2%	7.8%	3.9%	5.0%	1.0%	1.1%	1.2%
BA or BS Diploma/Degree	5.7%	2.7%	1.3%	3.9%	1.2%	1.7%	0.3%	2.3%
Occupational Licensure	15.6%	14.%	11.9%	17.%	22.%	19.%	19.4%	10.%
Occupational Certificate	32.3%	40.4%	42.2%	36.8%	37.2%	42.7%	45.2%	58.%
Occupational Certification	2.3%	4.5%	1.6%	10.5%	2.7%	3.8%	2.8%	9.3%
Other Recognized Credential	0.9%	1.7%	1.6%	1.3%	0.8%	1.0%	0.8%	1.2%

- Black participants that earned an AA/AS or BA/BS degree generally earned less than other groups

- Degree recipients generally had higher post-program earnings than license/certificate recipients

Table E8. Title I Adult Participants Post-Exit Earnings by Credentials Earned

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	ADULT Average Quarterly Wage 2 Quarters After Exit							
No recognized credential	$4,395	$4,754	$5,089	$5,536	$5,936	$4,854	$6,408	$6,625
AA or AS Diploma/Degree	$11,536	$10,107	$11,943		$10,172	$7,072		
BA or BS Diploma/Degree	$13,082	$10,743			$11,247	$8,684		
Occupational Licensure	$9,865	$9,575	$9,502	$12,958	$8,522	$8,691	$7,792	$7,180
Occupational Certificate	$7,208	$7,391	$6,660	$7,585	$6,764	$7,084	$7,669	$8,085
Occupational Certification	$6,394	$6,576			$6,640	$6,106	$6,155	

Title I Adult Participants Training Occupations

- About 70% of females enter training in Healthcare Practitioner or Healthcare Support.

- About 70% of males enter training in Transportation or Production

- Asian participants are more likely to enter Management or Computer/Mathematical training

Table E9a. Title I Adult Participants Training Occupations

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	ADULT Percent Receiving Training							
Received Training, total	85.0%	70.1%	74.8%	51.4%	79.8%	74.1%	80.1%	68.6%
Management	2.4%	7.8%	3.2%	28.6%	3.3%	3.8%	2.1%	22.5%
Computer and Math	3.1%	3.6%	3.4%	6.3%	8.8%	5.9%	5.7%	10.8%
Healthcare Practitioners	**56.0%**	**45.4%**	**34.1%**	**42.9%**	5.8%	3.1%	3.4%	6.7%
Healthcare Support	**19.4%**	**20.0%**	**25.5%**	**5.4%**	1.8%	1.0%	1.1%	0.0%
Office and Admin Support	4.1%	3.3%	7.8%	6.3%	1.4%	2.7%	1.7%	0.0%
Installation, Maint., & Repair	0.7%	0.3%	0.4%	0.9%	10.7%	3.5%	9.8%	6.7%
Production	4.2%	3.0%	9.1%	4.5%	**18.1%**	**11.8%**	**20.7%**	**22.5%**
Transp and Material Moving	5.2%	9.8%	10.1%	1.8%	**43.7%**	**64.0%**	**53.2%**	**23.3%**
All other	4.8%	6.9%	6.5%	3.6%	6.3%	4.1%	2.3%	7.5%

Table E9b. Title I Adult Participants Training Occupations

	Female	Male	Average Post-exit Wage
	ADULT Percent Receiving Training		
Received Training, total	75.0%	76.3%	$ 7,207
Management	5.9%	4.2%	$ 6,960
Computer and Math	3.5%	7.3%	$ 7,217
Healthcare Practitioners	**49.0%**	4.5%	$ 9,461
Healthcare Support	**19.8%**	1.3%	$ 5,080
Office and Admin Support	3.8%	1.8%	$ 4,968
Installation, Maint., & Repair	0.5%	6.9%	$ 6,258
Production	3.7%	**15.1%**	$ 6,002
Transp and Material Moving	7.8%	**54.1%**	$ 6,713
All other	6.1%	4.8%	

Title I Adult Participants – HS/less Training Occupations

- About two-thirds of females with a HS degree or less enter training in Healthcare Practitioner or Healthcare Support.

- About 76% of males with a HS degree or less enter training in Transportation or Production

- Asian participants are more likely to enter Management training

Table E10a. Title I Adult Participants with a HS degree or less Training Occupations

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	ADULT Percent Receiving Training							
Received Training, total	40.5%	44.8%	48.8%	27.5%	54.0%	55.6%	62.3%	29.7%
Management	1.4%	6.7%	2.9%	38.3%	1.0%	2.6%	1.0%	23.1%
Computer and Math	1.9%	2.3%	2.6%	1.7%	5.6%	3.2%	3.7%	0.0%
Healthcare Practitioners	**41.3%**	**41.1%**	**23.9%**	**35.0%**	3.3%	2.2%	2.9%	1.9%
Healthcare Support	**29.1%**	**24.5%**	**33.5%**	**5.0%**	1.8%	0.7%	1.0%	0.0%
Office and Admin Support	4.1%	3.1%	6.8%	6.7%	1.6%	2.9%	2.0%	0.0%
Installation, Maint., & Repair	1.0%	0.2%	0.6%	0.0%	12.1%	3.6%	8.8%	7.7%
Production	7.9%	3.6%	11.9%	8.3%	**19.6%**	**12.6%**	**22.6%**	**34.6%**
Transp and Material Moving	8.3%	11.7%	12.6%	1.7%	**49.5%**	**69.3%**	**55.8%**	**26.9%**
All other	4.9%	6.7%	5.2%	3.3%	5.5%	2.9%	2.2%	5.8%

Table E10b. Title I Adult Participants with a HS degree or less Training Occupations

	Female	Male	Average Post-exit Wage
	ADULT Percent Receiving Training		
Received Training, total	72.8%	77.9%	$6,532
Management	5.5%	2.5%	$5,722
Computer and Math	2.2%	4.1%	$5,864
Healthcare Practitioners	**39.9%**	2.8%	$8,525
Healthcare Support	**26.2%**	1.2%	$4,879
Office and Admin Support	3.7%	2.0%	$5,032
Installation, Maint., & Repair	0.5%	7.4%	$6,017
Production	5.5%	**16.4%**	$5,978
Transp and Material Moving	10.5%	**60.0%**	$6,690
All other	6.0%	3.7%	

Title I Adult Participants Training Occupations Outcomes

- Those trained in Healthcare occupations are more likely to have wages (wages > $0)

- About one-quarter of those trained in Computer/Mathematical and Transportation have no wages

- When only those that are employed (have wages >$0), the disparity between Healthcare Practitioner and Transportation earnings narrows considerably

Table E11. Title I Adult Participants Post-Exit Earnings by Training Occupation

	Received Training Average 2Q Post-exit Wage		
	All	With Wages	% No Wage
Received Training, total	$7,207	$8,718	17.3%
Management	$6,960	$9,020	22.8%
Computer and Mathematical	$7,217	$9,605	24.9%
Healthcare Practitioners	**$9,461**	**$10,240**	**7.6%**
Healthcare Support	**$5,080**	**$5,757**	**11.8%**
Office and Adm Support	$4,968	$6,318	21.4%
Installation, Maint, & Repair	$6,258	$7,953	21.3%
Production	**$6,002**	**$7,376**	**18.6%**
Transp and Material Moving	**$6,713**	**$9,098**	**26.2%**

Title I Adult Participants – HS/less Training Occupations Outcomes

- Those trained in Healthcare occupations are more likely to have wages (wages > $0)

- Nearly one-quarter of those trained in Computer/Mathematical and Transportation have no wages

- When only those that are employed (have wages >$0), the disparity between Healthcare Practitioner and Transportation earnings narrows considerably

Table E12. Title I Adult Participants with a HS degree or less Post-Exit Earnings by Training Occupation

	Received Training Average 2Q Post-exit Wage		
	All	With Wages	% No Wage
Received Training, total	$6,532	$8,039	18.8%
Management	$5,722	$7,351	22.2%
Computer and Mathematical	$5,864	$7,651	23.4%
Healthcare Practitioners	**$8,525**	**$9,408**	**9.4%**
Healthcare Support	**$4,879**	**$5,533**	**11.8%**
Office and Adm Support	$5,032	$6,265	19.7%
Installation, Maint, & Repair	$6,017	$7,456	19.3%

Production	$5,978 $7,268	17.7%
Transp and Material Moving	$6,690 $9,110	26.6%

Title I Female Adult Participants Training Occupations Outcomes – Healthcare

- About 70% of females enter training in Healthcare Practitioner or Healthcare Support.

- About 35% of ALL females enter training for Registered Nursing or Licensed Practical Nursing

- White females are somewhat more likely (43%) to enter one of these training programs compared with Asian females (35%), Black females (31%), or Hispanic females (17%)

- Nearly 20% of ALL female participants enter training in Healthcare Support (primarily Nursing or Medical Assistants), in which exiters earn less than half the average wage of Registered Nurse/LPN

Table E13. Title I Adult Female Participants Training Occupations Outcomes – Healthcare

	Female			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	ADULT Percent Receiving Training			
Registered Nurses	30.8%	9.3%	10.7%	12.5%
Licensed Practical and Vocational Nurses	12.4%	21.9%	6.7%	25.0%
All Other Healthcare Practitioner	11.5%	13.7%	16.0%	5.4%
Healthcare Support	19.4%	20.0%	25.5%	5.4%

	Female			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	ADULT Average Quarterly Wage 2 Quarters After Exit			
Received Training, total	$7,895	$7,043	$7,090	$7,512
Registered Nurses	$11,233	$11,197	$11,816	$12,743
Licensed Practical and Vocational Nurses	$9,341	$10,350	$10,707	$11,487
All Other Healthcare Practitioner	$6,975	$5,343	$6,880	$2,028
Healthcare Support	$5,022	$4,852	$5,764	$6,954

Title I Female Adult Participants – HS/less Training Occupations Outcomes – Healthcare

- About two-thirds of females with a HS degree or less enter training in Healthcare Practitioner or Healthcare Support.

Table E14. Title I Adult Female Participants with a HS degree or less Healthcare Training Occupations Outcomes

	Female			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	ADULT Percent Receiving Training			
Registered Nurses	15.6%	5.3%	4.2%	11.7%
Licensed Practical and Vocational Nurses	11.3%	20.2%	4.8%	18.3%
All Other Healthcare Practitioner	12.7%	15.3%	14.2%	5.0%
Healthcare Support	29.1%	24.5%	33.5%	5.0%

	Female			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	ADULT Average Quarterly Wage 2 Quarters After Exit			
Received Training, total	$6,450	$6,369	$6,310	$7,392
Registered Nurses	$9,148	$9,441	$12,575	
Licensed Practical and Vocational Nurses	$9,116	$10,837	$9,264	
All Other Healthcare Practitioner	$6,975	$5,343	$6,880	$2,028
Healthcare Support	$4,941	$4,622	$5,673	$4,913

- About 70% of males enter training in Transportation or Production

- Black males are more likely to enter Truck Driver training

- For the most popular Production occupation (Computer-Controlled Machine Tool Operators), Black males earn significantly less than other groups

- Asian males are much more likely to enter training in CNC Machine Tool Programmers, which have higher earnings outcomes than most other productions occupations

Table E15. Title I Adult Male Participants Training Occupations Outcomes – Production and Transportation

	Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	ADULT Percent Receiving Training			
Production	18.1%	11.8%	20.7%	22.5%
Team Assemblers	0.7%	1.7%	1.7%	0.8%
Computer-Controlled Tool Operators	6.4%	4.1%	10.3%	6.7%
CNC Machine Tool Programmers	1.5%	1.0%	1.7%	13.3%
Machinists	1.6%	0.4%	0.6%	0.0%
Welders, Cutters, and Brazers	3.7%	1.5%	1.1%	0.0%
Welding Machine Operators	1.4%	0.9%	0.8%	0.8%
All other Production	2.8%	2.2%	4.4%	0.8%
Transportation and Material Moving	43.7%	**64.0%**	53.2%	23.3%
Heavy and Tractor-Trailer Truck Drivers	38.9%	57.3%	47.8%	21.7%

	Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	ADULT Average Quarterly Wage 2 Quarters After Exit			
Received Training, total	7,022	6,705	7,095	7,608
Production	6,185	5,586	6,566	9,207
Team Assemblers		8,046	8,116	
Computer-Controlled Tool Operators	**6,161**	**4,497**	**5,621**	
CNC Machine Tool Programmers	5,268	6,952		**8,155**
Machinists	5,378			
Welders, Cutters, and Brazers	5,296	4,862		
Welding Machine Operators	5,624	7,177		
All other Production	8,731	5,358	8,416	
Transportation and Material Moving	7,108	**6,910**	6,867	**3,813**

Heavy and Tractor-Trailer Truck Drivers	7,298	**7,207**	7,066	4,106

Title I Adult Participants Takeaways

Participant characteristics prior to program enrollment

- Educational attainment differed among race/ethnicity groups

  - Asian participants were more likely to have a bachelors degree or higher

  - Black and Hispanic participants were more likely to have attainment of HS or less

- Pre-enrollment earnings and were not strongly correlated with education levels

Services accessed

- White participants (especially white females) tended to be more likely to access career and training services

  - Males of all race/ethnicity group were slightly more likely to complete training

Post-exit earnings

- Training was associated with higher earnings for all participant groups

  - But those that entered training but did not complete had lower post-exit incomes than those that did not enter training

  - Training occupation matters: White females had higher earnings largely because they chose to train in higher-paying healthcare occupations

  - Nearly two-thirds of Black males chose Truck Driving, which resulted in lower wages and a higher likelihood of having no wages

Title I Dislocated Worker Participants

Title I Dislocated Worker Participants Pre-enrollment characteristics

- Black and Hispanic participants have lower education levels at entry than other groups

- Females have higher attainment rates than males

- Asians are much more likely to have a bachelors degree or higher

Table E16. Title I Dislocated Worker Participants Pre-enrollment characteristics

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	DW Educational Attainment at Enrollment							
Particpants	1,336	958	380	126	2,332	995	763	176
HS Equiv or less	42.8%	43.0%	61.1%	14.3%	50.5%	61.9%	70.2%	10.8%
Assoc/Some College	26.2%	22.7%	20.8%	10.3%	22.3%	21.4%	17.3%	10.2%
Bach or higher	31.0%	34.3%	18.2%	75.4%	27.2%	16.7%	12.5%	79.0%

- For DW participants, higher educational attainment is reflected in pre-enrollment earnings

- Asians tend to have higher wages 3 quarters prior to enrollment

- For most race/ethnicity groups, males tend to have higher pre-enrollment earnings

- Those groups with lower incomes were more likely to be identified as low income.

Table E17. Title I Dislocated Worker Participants Pre-enrollment earnings

	Female	Male

	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	DW Average Quarterly Wage 3 Quarters Prior to Enrollment							
HS Equiv or less	$8,870	$6,759	$8,353	$12,618	$10,388	$7,710	$9,917	$11,662
Assoc/Some College	$8,989	$8,028	$9,506	$12,044	$12,839	$9,230	$11,230	$14,526
Bach or higher	$16,652	$12,118	$12,763	$20,341	$19,049	$12,627	$16,496	$24,728
All Exiters	$11,313	$8,887	$9,394	$18,381	$13,289	$8,856	$10,963	$22,274
Low Income	18.10%	46.10%	29.20%	9.00%	13.60%	34.30%	26.90%	9.10%

Title I Dislocated Worker Participants Services Accessed

- Asians are less likely to receive staff-assisted services, but more likely to access self services and enter training

- Black and Hispanic DW participants are less likely to access self services relative to other groups

- Black and Hispanic females are significantly less likely to enter training

- Males are generally more likely to complete training

Table E18. Title I Dislocated Worker Participants Services Accessed

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	DW Percentage of Participants							
Self Services	38.3%	30.1%	34.4%	42.4%	43.8%	30.2%	28.4%	49.5%
Staff Services	45.8%	47.3%	44.5%	29.9%	40.4%	45.2%	44.4%	30.6%
Rec'd Training	74.8%	63.8%	67.5%	83.3%	79.8%	78.1%	80.4%	84.9%
Tng Completed	81.1%	79.6%	80.1%	88.3%	85.4%	82.1%	87.9%	86.7%

- For DW participants, training had a smaller impact on earnings compared with Adult participants.

- Training completion was associated with higher earnings

- Asian participants had higher post-exit wages than all other groups

- White males, while lower than Asian participants, had higher wages than all other groups

Table E19. Title I Dislocated Worker Participants Post-Exit Earnings by Services Accessed

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	DW Average Quarterly Wage 2 Quarters After Exit							
All DW	$9,435	$8,656	$8,815	$15,807	$12,456	$9,679	$10,495	$15,972

Self Services	$9,217	$9,015	$8,591	$15,431	$12,690	$10,096	$10,481	$14,392
Staff Services	$8,857	$8,689	$8,609	$15,990	$11,338	$8,703	$10,614	$16,006
Rec'd Training	$9,723	$9,366	$8,814	$16,065	$12,822	$10,118	$10,547	$15,776
Tng Completed	$10,084	$9,935	$9,137	$16,433	$12,889	$10,431	$10,740	$15,545
Tng Not Compl	$8,174	$7,138	$7,511	$13,275	$12,430	$8,677	$9,137	$17,288
No Training	$8,580	$7,406	$8,816	$14,519	$11,012	$8,112	$10,285	$17,073

- Males in DW programs that entered training were generally more likely to earn a credential than females

- White females were significantly more likely to earn an AA/AS or BA/BS degree

- Males were less likely than females to earn an AA/AS or BA/BS degree but more likely to earn an Occupational License or Certificate

Table E20. Title I Dislocated Worker Participants Credentials Earned

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	DW Type of Recognized Credential							
Earned Any Credential	70.1%	61.1%	57.7%	60.0%	73.6%	64.9%	70.7%	76.9%
AA or AS Diploma/Degr	12.9%	2.1%	6.4%	0.0%	3.9%	1.1%	1.1%	0.0%
BA or BS Diploma/Degr	1.5%	1.0%	0.0%	0.0%	0.8%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Occupational Licensure	10.3%	6.9%	9.0%	0.0%	20.5%	22.1%	21.3%	0.0%
Occ Certificate	39.2%	44.1%	34.6%	60.0%	39.9%	34.3%	41.4%	61.5%
Occ Certification	6.2%	4.5%	7.7%	0.0%	8.1%	4.8%	5.7%	0.0%
Other Recognized Cred	0.0%	2.4%	0.0%	0.0%	0.4%	2.6%	1.1%	15.4%

- Males in DW programs that earned a credential generally earned more than females

- Black males had the highest earnings after earning an AA/AS degree, but were less likely than many other groups to complete these types of credentials

Table E21. Title I Dislocated Worker Participants Post-Exit Earnings by Credentials Earned

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	DW Average Quarterly Wage 2 Quarters After Exit							
No recognized credential	$ 8,718	$ 7,874	$ 8,797	$16,147	$11,467	$ 8,915	$10,243	$19,101
AA or AS Diploma/Degree	$ 7,237	$ 7,999	$ 6,991		$12,612	$14,022		
BA or BS Diploma/Degree	$10,405	$10,427			$ 9,903	$ 8,229		
Occupational Licensure	$ 9,183	$ 6,650	$ 8,059		$10,296	$10,508	$ 9,459	$ 8,926
Occupational Certificate	$10,921	$10,327	$ 9,134	$15,398	$14,302	$10,166	$11,330	$14,542
Occupational Certification	$13,245	$11,226			$13,312	$ 9,275	$11,123	

Title I Dislocated Worker Participants Training Occupations

- Training occupations are more diverse for DW participants relative to Adult participants

- Females are equally likely to enter training in Management, Computer/Mathematical , or Healthcare Practitioner

- However, differences exist between the race/ethnicity groups

- About 60% of Black and Hispanic males enter training in Transportation or Production

- Asian participants are more likely to enter Management or Computer/Mathematical training, which have the highest post-exit wages

Table E22a. Title I Dislocated Worker Participants Training Occupations

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	DW Percent Receiving Training							
Received Training, total	74.8%	63.8%	67.5%	83.3%	79.8%	78.1%	80.4%	84.9%
Management	15.6%	20.1%	10.1%	26.7%	14.8%	7.7%	8.5%	25.9%
Computer and Math	14.7%	17.5%	11.5%	50.0%	17.7%	14.4%	11.3%	54.4%
Healthcare Practitioners	23.3%	14.7%	12.9%	6.7%	3.3%	1.9%	0.9%	1.3%
Healthcare Support	9.0%	11.8%	9.4%	4.2%	0.4%	0.8%	0.1%	0.6%
Office and Admin Support	14.7%	8.4%	24.4%	5.0%	0.9%	1.6%	1.8%	0.0%
Installation, Maint, & Repair	1.2%	1.0%	2.8%	0.0%	13.5%	10.2%	9.8%	5.1%
Production	3.5%	4.3%	12.9%	0.0%	10.7%	12.0%	13.4%	3.8%
Transportation	4.5%	9.7%	7.7%	0.0%	31.1%	46.7%	50.8%	2.5%
All other	13.5%	12.4%	8.4%	7.5%	7.7%	4.8%	3.3%	6.3%

Table E22b. Title I Dislocated Worker Participants Training Occupations

	Female	Male	Average Post-exit Wage
	All Participants		
Received Training, total	70.9%	79.6%	$11,222
Management	17.4%	12.7%	$15,836
Computer and Math	17.6%	18.3%	$13,407
Healthcare Practitioners	18.7%	2.7%	$9,238
Healthcare Support	9.8%	0.6%	$5,681
Office and Admin Support	12.5%	1.0%	$6,850
Installation, Maint, & Repair	1.1%	11.9%	$12,972
Production	4.2%	11.1%	$10,134
Transportation	6.4%	35.2%	$9,321
All other	12.4%	6.5%	

- The highest earnings outcomes are for Management occupations, where presumably DW participants can build upon their work experience.

- For Black males, earnings outcomes are best are best for management occupations, however they are less likely to enter these training programs than other groups.

- Asian participants are more likely to enter Computer/Mathematical training and they have better earning outcomes from these programs than other groups, which drives the significantly higher average wage levels for Asian participants

Table E23. Title I Dislocated Worker Participants Post-Exit Earnings by Training Occupations

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	DW Average Quarterly Wage 2 Quarters After Exit							
Received Training, total	9,723	9,366	8,814	16,065	12,822	10,118	10,547	15,776
Management	13,179	12,896	14,117	17,338	19,267	14,081	15,088	17,283
Computer and Math	14,164	11,516	11,999	17,259	13,446	10,864	12,954	17,204
Healthcare Practitioners	8,614	7,805	7,066		11,318	10,619		
Healthcare Support	5,400	5,120	6,257					
Office and Admin Support	6,672	7,138	7,188		7,265	4,572	6,801	
Installation, Maint, & Repair	13,837		11,953		13,644	11,604	13,723	
Production	10,659	6,647	7,972		11,324	9,527	9,671	
Transportation	6,613	7,608	8,136		10,066	9,018	8,856	

- The percentage of DW participants without wages is somewhat lower than Title 1 Adult participants.

- However, those trained in Computer/Mathematical and Transportation still have the highest rates of $0 wages

Table E24. Title I Dislocated Worker Participants Post-Exit Earnings by Training Occupation

	Received Training Average 2Q Post-exit Wage		
	All	With Wages	% No Wage
Received Training, total	$11,222	$13,092	14.3%
Management	$15,836	$18,525	14.5%
Computer and Mathematical	$13,407	$16,506	18.8%
Healthcare Practitioners	$9,238	$10,481	11.9%
Healthcare Support	$5,681	$6,481	12.3%
Office and Admin Support	$6,850	$8,122	15.7%
Installation, Maint, & Repair	$12,972	$14,454	10.3%
Production	$10,134	$11,059	8.4%
Transportation and Material Moving	$9,321	$11,048	15.6%

- About 29% of females enter training in Healthcare Practitioner or Healthcare Support.

- Compared to title 1 Adult participants, DW participants that train in Healthcare are more likely to enter training in Other Healthcare Practitioner or Healthcare Support occupations, which are lower paying than Registered Nurse

- White female participants are more likely to enter the higher paying Registered Nurse training than other race/ethnicity groups

Table E25. Title I Dislocated Worker Female Participants Training Occupations Outcomes – Healthcare

	Female			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	DW Percent Receiving Training			
Registered Nurses	7.8%	1.0%	1.4%	1.7%
Licensed Practical and Vocational Nurses	2.5%	3.3%	0.7%	1.7%
All Other Healthcare Practitioner	13.0%	10.3%	10.8%	3.3%
Healthcare Support	9.0%	11.8%	9.4%	4.2%

	Female			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	DW Average Quarterly Wage 2 Quarters After Exit			
Received Training, total	$9,723	$9,366	$8,814	
Registered Nurses	$11,036			
Licensed Practical and Vocational Nurses	$8,949	$8,817		

All Other Healthcare Practitioner	$8,558	$9,021	$7,134
Healthcare Support	$5,400	$5,120	$6,257

- About 35% of all Dislocated Worker males enter training in Transportation

- Hispanic and Black males are more likely to enter Truck Driver training

Table E26. Title I Dislocated Worker Male Participants Training Occupations Outcomes –Transportation

	Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	DW Percent Receiving Training			
Transportation and Material Moving	31.1%	46.7%	50.8%	2.5%
Heavy and Tractor-Trailer Truck Drivers	29.6%	42.9%	47.1%	2.5%

	Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	DW Avg Quarterly Wage 2 Q After Exit			
Received Training, total	12,822	10,118	10,547	15,776
Transportation and Material Moving	10,066	9,018	8,856	
Heavy and Tractor-Trailer Truck Drivers	10,169	9,246	9,004	

Title I Dislocated Worker Participants Takeaways

Participant characteristics prior to program enrollment

- Educational attainment differed among race/ethnicity groups

    - Asian participants were significantly more likely to have a bachelors degree or higher

    - Hispanic participants were more likely to have attainment of HS or less

- Pre-enrollment earnings and were correlated with education levels

Services accessed

- Asian participants were more likely to access self services but less likely to access staff-assisted services

- Black and Hispanic female participants were less likely to access training services

    - Males were slightly more likely to complete training

Post-exit earnings

- Asian participants had significantly higher earnings than other groups, although they entered with higher education levels and higher pre-enrollment earnings

- Training was associated with higher earnings for all participant groups

- But the differences were smaller than for Title 1 Adult participants

- Training occupation matters

- White females had higher earnings largely because they chose to train in higher-paying healthcare occupations

- Roughly half of Black and Hispanic males chose Truck Driving, which resulted in lower wages and a higher likelihood of having no wages

Title I Youth Participants

- Black and Hispanic participants have lower education levels at entry than other groups

- Females have higher attainment rates than males

Table E27. Title I Youth Participants Pre-enrollment characteristics

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	Youth Educational Attainment at Enrollment							
Particpants	1,452	1,840	819	74	1,303	1,360	725	68
HS Equiv or less	94.4%	95.5%	96.3%	97.3%	97.7%	96.5%	97.2%	95.6%
Assoc/Some College	5.2%	4.0%	3.3%	1.4%	2.1%	2.6%	2.3%	4.4%
Bach or higher	0.3%	0.5%	0.4%	1.4%	0.2%	0.9%	0.4%	0.0%

- For youth participants, higher educational attainment is reflected in pre-enrollment earnings

- White participants tended to have lower wages 3 quarters prior to enrollment

- For most race/ethnicity groups, females tend to have higher pre-enrollment earnings

Table E28. Title I Youth Participants Pre-enrollment earnings

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	Youth Average Quarterly Wage 3 Quarters Prior to Enrollment							
HS Equiv or less	$1,253	$1,447	$1,531	$482	$1,159	$1,296	$1,659	$697
Assoc/Some College	$2,249	$2,734	$2,837		$1,736	$2,300	$2,112	$2,034
All Exiters	$1,308	$1,498	$1,569	$549	$1,174	$1,321	$1,668	$756
Low Income	59.20%	73.80%	53.40%	70.30%	48.40%	59.30%	46.00%	57.40%

- Asians are more likely to receive staff-assisted services, but less likely to access self services and enter training

- White participants are significantly more likely to enter training

Table E29. Title I Youth Participants Services Accessed

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	YOUTH Percentage of Participants							
Self Services	20.9%	16.1%	9.0%	4.1%	19.0%	14.4%	7.4%	5.9%
Staff Services	60.1%	55.3%	55.9%	74.3%	57.8%	54.1%	57.4%	69.1%
Rec'd Training	70.2%	53.7%	54.7%	31.1%	65.2%	44.3%	56.1%	47.1%
Tng Completed	73.6%	73.6%	74.6%	69.6%	72.5%	73.8%	69.8%	90.6%

- Training completion was associated with higher earnings

- Hispanic participants had higher post-exit wages than all other groups

Table E30. Title I Youth Participants Post-Exit Earnings by Services Accessed

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	YOUTH Average Quarterly Wage 2 Quarters After Exit							
All Youth	$3,225	$3,445	$3,639	$1,281	$3,461	$3,287	$4,232	$2,753
Self Services	$3,932	$3,581	$4,298		$3,726	$3,145	$4,933	
Staff Services	$3,522	$3,441	$3,721	$979	$3,660	$3,338	$4,242	$2,750
Rec'd Training	$3,609	$4,057	$4,226	$1,869	$3,756	$4,121	$4,559	$3,690
Tng Completed	$3,943	$4,381	$4,560	$1,570	$3,930	$4,618	$4,607	$3,789
Tng Not Compl	$2,678	$3,155	$3,245		$3,296	$2,723	$4,448	
No Training	$2,322	$2,736	$2,931	$1,016	$2,906	$2,624	$3,814	$1,921

- White participants were significantly more likely to earn HS diploma or equivalent

- Asian males were significantly more likely to earn an AA/AS degree

- Males were less likely than females to earn an Occupational License but less likely to earn an Occupational Certificate

Table E31. Title I Youth Participants Credentials Earned

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	YOUTH Type of Recognized Credential							
Earned Any Credential	69.0%	69.6%	67.2%	64.3%	67.1%	67.3%	61.0%	57.1%
HS Diploma/or equivalency	32.8%	10.2%	20.2%	28.6%	36.8%	14.8%	17.6%	14.3%
AA or AS Diploma/Degree	5.9%	0.4%	5.1%	0.0%	3.4%	0.9%	3.7%	21.4%
BA or BS Diploma/Degree	0.8%	0.7%	1.6%	0.0%	0.3%	0.0%	0.0%	0.0%
Occupational Licensure	5.2%	3.9%	4.7%	0.0%	4.5%	14.5%	8.0%	7.1%

Occupational Certificate	23.3%	48.4%	32.8%	28.6%	20.5%	31.0%	28.9%	14.3%
Occupational Certification	0.8%	3.7%	1.2%	7.1%	1.3%	4.0%	2.1%	0.0%
Other Recognized Credential	33.0%	12.5%	21.7%	28.6%	37.1%	17.0%	18.2%	14.3%

- Hispanic participants generally earned more than other groups

- Occupational license/certificate recipients earned more than those without an earned credential

Table E32. Title I Youth Participants Post-Exit Earnings by Credentials Earned

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	Youth Average Quarterly Wage 2 Quarters After Exit							
No recognized credential	$2,506	$2,882	$3,070	$1,568	$2,943	$2,709	$3,929	$2,467
HS Diploma/or equivalency	$2,541	$2,952	$2,630		$3,055	$2,147	$3,530	
AA or AS Diploma/Degree	$6,874		$8,408		$6,659			
BA or BS Diploma/Degree								
Occupational Licensure	$6,401	$5,776	$5,485		$7,610	$6,847	$5,817	
Occupational Certificate	$4,952	$4,319	$5,549		$4,750	$4,487	$5,409	
Occupational Certification		$4,913				$5,670		

Title I Youth Participants Training Occupations

- Training occupations are more diverse for Youth participants relative to Adult participants

- About 60% of Females are enter training in Educational Instruction/Library or Healthcare fields

- About one-third of Black males enter training in Transportation, a significantly higher proportion than other groups

- Asian participants are more likely to enter Computer/Mathematical training

Table E33a. Title I Adult Participants Training Occupations

Female	Male

	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	YOUTH Percent Receiving Training							
Received Training, total	51.9%	36.6%	70.6%	10.6%	59.9%	31.2%	62.3%	18.3%
Management	0.2%	0.6%	0.2%	0.0%	1.6%	2.3%	1.5%	6.3%
Computer and Math	13.4%	7.3%	12.1%	17.4%	14.2%	12.5%	12.8%	15.6%
Healthcare Practitioners	**14.8%**	**24.8%**	**15.4%**	**21.7%**	1.6%	3.2%	3.2%	0.0%
Healthcare Support	**17.5%**	**39.8%**	**23.9%**	**17.4%**	1.1%	1.8%	2.7%	0.0%
Office and Admin Support	2.7%	2.9%	5.1%	0.0%	1.1%	3.2%	1.0%	0.0%
Installation, Maint., & Repair	0.9%	0.3%	0.0%	0.0%	6.8%	4.7%	9.3%	0.0%
Production	1.1%	0.7%	0.4%	0.0%	**8.3%**	**7.5%**	**5.4%**	**3.1%**
Transp and Material Moving	0.3%	2.2%	1.3%	0.0%	**8.1%**	**33.4%**	**20.6%**	**9.4%**
All other	49.1%	21.4%	41.5%	43.5%	57.2%	31.6%	43.5%	65.6%

Table E33b. Title I Adult Participants Training Occupations

	Female	Male	Average Post-exit Wage
	YOUTH Percent Receiving Training		
Received Training, total	58.7%	53.7%	$3,949
Management	0.4%	2.0%	$4,591
Computer and Math	10.8%	14.2%	$2,380
Healthcare Practitioners	**20.2%**	2.3%	$5,727
Healthcare Support	**28.7%**	1.6%	$4,414
Office and Admin Support	2.8%	1.7%	$3,887
Installation, Maint., & Repair	0.5%	5.5%	$4,697
Production	0.8%	**7.8%**	$4,649
Transp and Material Moving	1.3%	**19.3%**	$6,474
All other	34.6%	45.6%	$2,959

Title I Youth Participants Training Occupations Outcomes

- The highest earnings outcomes are for Healthcare and Transportation occupations

- For Black females, earnings outcomes are best are best for Healthcare Practitioner occupations

- However, their earnings were significantly lower than White females in this occupation group

- For Black males, earnings outcomes are best are best for Transportation occupations

- Transportation attracts the highest percentage of Black males

Table E34. Title I Youth Participants Post-Exit Earnings by Training Occupations

	Female				Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	YOUTH Average Quarterly Wage 2 Quarters After Exit							
Received Training, total	3,609	4,057	4,226	1,869	3,756	4,121	4,559	3,690
Management					3,134	5,120		
Computer and Math	2,095	2,296	2,300		2,853	1,481	4,155	
Healthcare Practitioners	6,943	4,927	6,664		3,911	3,326	3,495	
Healthcare Support	4,199	4,286	5,050			4,334	4,274	
Office and Admin Support	4,978	3,028	4,730			3,805		
Installation, Maint., & Repair					5,650	2,832	5,674	
Production	4,736				5,208	3,368	6,266	
Transp and Material Moving		4,965	5,983		6,882	6,865	5,884	

- The percentage of youth participants without wages is higher than Title 1 Adult participants

- This might be explained by school attendance

- As with the Adult and DW programs, those that received training in a Healthcare occupation were more likely to have earned wages in the 2nd quarter after program exit

Table E35. Title I Youth Participants Post-Exit Earnings by Training Occupation

Received Training Average

	2Q Post-exit Wage		
	All	With Wages	% No Wage
Received Training, total	$3,949	$4,976	20.6%
Computer and Mathematical	$4,591	$5,671	19.0%
Educational Instruction and Library	$2,380	$3,523	32.4%
Healthcare Practitioners	$5,727	$6,484	11.7%
Healthcare Support	$4,414	$4,856	9.1%
Office and Administrative Support	$3,887	$4,535	14.3%
Installation, Maint, and Repair	$4,697	$5,615	16.3%
Production	$4,649	$5,754	19.2%
Transportation and Material Moving	$6,474	$8,202	21.1%
All other	$2,959	$4,148	25.6%

Title I Female Youth Participants Training Occupations Outcomes – Healthcare

- About 49% of females enter training in Healthcare Practitioner or Healthcare Support.

- For Youth participants, Healthcare Support occupations are more likely

- Earnings outcomes for female Black and Hispanic Youth participants compare favorably to White participants for most Healthcare training occupations

- However, White female Youth participants are significantly more likely to enter Registered Nursing training, which leads to higher wages compared to the other occupations

Table E36. Title I Youth Female Participants Training Occupations Outcomes – Healthcare

	Female			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	YOUTH Percent Receiving Training			
Registered Nurses	5.4%	1.3%	2.0%	0.0%
Licensed Practical and Vocational Nurses	3.4%	3.2%	2.7%	8.7%
Health Technicians, All Other	0.5%	0.3%	0.9%	0.0%
All Other Healthcare Practitioner	3.1%	7.2%	6.3%	8.7%
Healthcare Support	17.5%	39.8%	23.9%	17.4%

	Female			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	YOUTH Average Quarterly Wage 2 Quarters After Exit			
Received Training, total	$3,609	$4,057	$4,226	
Registered Nurses	$7,993	$9,910		
Licensed Practical and Vocational Nurses	$7,850	$7,534	$8,319	
Health Technicians, All Other	$3,825	$4,703	$4,427	
All Other Healthcare Practitioner	$4,614	$3,453	$5,389	
Healthcare Support	$4,199	$4,286	$5,050	

Title I Male Youth Participants Training Occupations Outcomes –Transportation

- About 35% of males enter training in Transportation

- Hispanic and Black males are more likely to enter Truck Driver training

Table E37. Title I Youth Male Participants Training Occupations Outcomes –Transportation

	Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	YOUTH Percent Receiving Training			
Transportation and Material Moving	8.1%	33.4%	20.6%	9.4%
Heavy and Tractor-Trailer Truck Drivers	7.3%	30.1%	17.7%	9.4%

	Male			
	White	Black	Hispanic	Asian
	YOUTH Average Quarterly Wage 2 Quarters After Exit			
Received Training, total	3,756	4,121	4,559	3,690
Transportation and Material Moving	6,882	**6,865**	5,884	
Heavy and Tractor-Trailer Truck Drivers	6,808	**6,856**	6,008	

Title I Youth Participants

Takeaways

Participant characteristics prior to program enrollment

- Title 1 Youth programs attract I higher percentage of female participants relative to the Opportunity Youth population

- The vast majority of Youth participants (95% or more) had no education beyond high school

- Those that did have some college had higher pre-enrollment earnings

Services accessed

- Asian participants were more likely to access self services but less likely to access staff-assisted services

- White participants were more likely to access training services

Post-exit earnings

- Hispanic Youth participants had higher earnings than other groups, although they entered with higher pre-enrollment earnings

- Training was associated with higher earnings for all participant groups

    - But the differences were smaller than for Title 1 Adult participants

    - Training occupation matters

    - Black and Hispanic males had higher earnings largely because they chose to train in higher-paying (for Youth) Transportation occupations

    - Black females were much more likely to enter training in Healthcare Support occupations, which had lower earnings outcomes than most other Healthcare occupations